

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 50507

Date: 03/03/2025

Title: "Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma Breast: A Rare Subtype"

Recommendation:

- ✓ Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 05/03/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This paper presents a clinically significant case of Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma of the breast, highlighting its rarity, diagnostic challenges, and pathological characteristics. While it effectively covers immunohistochemical differentiation, improvements in language, case presentation, and treatment discussion would enhance its impact. Proper formatting and grammar refinement are also recommended for clarity and professionalism.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths:

- 1. Relevant and Well-Defined Topic:** The paper focuses on Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma (SRCC) of the breast, a rare and aggressive subtype, making it a valuable addition to medical literature.
- 2. Case Presentation:** A clear case study of a 60-year-old female provides clinical insight into diagnosis, histopathology, and treatment, which enhances the paper's practical significance.
- 3. Use of Immunohistochemistry:** The inclusion of ER, PR, HER2, CDX2, CK7, MUC1, and E-cadherin markers improves the depth of analysis and supports differentiation from metastatic tumors.
- 4. Discussion on Differential Diagnosis:** The comparison of CK7 and CK20 expressions for distinguishing primary breast SRCC from gastrointestinal SRCC adds a critical diagnostic perspective.
- 5. References to Prior Studies:** The study is well-supported by literature citations, including Li et al. (2013) and Chu et al. (2004), enhancing its credibility.

Areas for Improvement:

- 1. Grammar and Language Refinement:** Some grammatical errors and awkward phrasing reduce readability.

Example: "We report a case of 60-year female who was normal."

Correction: "We report a case of a 60-year-old female who was initially asymptomatic."

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Example: *"It can be found in association with infiltrating lobular carcinoma, and ductal carcinoma but can be in its pure form which is extremely rare."*

Correction: *"It can be associated with infiltrating lobular carcinoma and ductal carcinoma, but its pure form is extremely rare."*

2. Clarity in Case Presentation: The case presentation lacks a clear timeline of symptom progression. It mentions a history of trauma two months prior but does not clarify if trauma had any role in the onset of symptoms.

3. Histopathological Description: More details on microscopic tumor characteristics, beyond the grading system, would enhance understanding. Figures/images should be referenced properly in the text.

4. Discussion Depth: The discussion on treatment and prognosis is relatively brief. It could benefit from a comparison of treatment strategies (e.g., surgery, chemotherapy, targeted therapy) in SRCC cases.

5. Formatting and Consistency: The paper has irregular spacing and formatting issues. The reference list needs proper formatting (e.g., journal names should be italicized or in APA/AMA style).