

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.:IJAR-50530

Date: 5/03/25

Title: "AN ANALYSIS OF PROCEDURES AND MANAGEMENT OF MUSLIM PROPERTY AT BAITULMAL"

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		Yes		
Techn. Quality		Yes		
Clarity		Yes		
Significance	Yes			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Feroze Ahmad

Date:5/03/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

This manuscript offers a thorough analysis of Baitulmal's role in managing key Muslim property categories, such as found property, debts, unclaimed assets, and estate redemption. It highlights the importance of systematic, Sharia-compliant management practices to ensure that resources are effectively utilized for the benefit of the Muslim community. The study's relevance to contemporary practices and its integration of Islamic jurisprudence make it a valuable contribution to the field.

Detailed Summary Review Report:

The research paper presents an in-depth analysis of the management of Muslim property at Baitulmal, particularly focusing on four key areas: found property (luqatah), debtors' money, unclaimed property, and estate redemption. The paper explores the significance of Baitulmal in administering these assets according to Islamic law and examines the practices of the Negeri Sembilan Islamic Religious Council (MAINS) as a case study. Using a qualitative approach, the paper reviews Islamic jurisprudence, legal frameworks, and current management practices. The study concludes that more systematic, Sharia-compliant procedures are required to ensure optimal use of Baitulmal resources and benefit eligible Muslims.

Strengths:

- 1. Comprehensive and Clear Focus:** The paper provides a comprehensive analysis of the four major types of property managed by Baitulmal, offering clear explanations of their importance in Islamic law. This ensures that the reader understands the core issues in managing Muslim property.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

2. **Detailed Exploration of Jurisprudence:** The paper incorporates classical and contemporary Islamic jurisprudence to substantiate its analysis, offering a deep understanding of how Islamic law guides the management of property and wealth.
3. **Relevance to Contemporary Practices:** By examining the role of the Negeri Sembilan Islamic Religious Council (MAINS), the paper connects theoretical analysis with real-world applications. This adds practical relevance to the study, making it applicable to policymakers, local authorities, and Islamic financial institutions.
4. **Methodology:** The use of library research and document analysis, focusing on the Management Manual of the Department of Waqf, Zakat, and Hajj (JAWHAR), provides a solid foundation for the analysis. The approach is well-structured and ensures comprehensive data collection.

Weaknesses:

1. **Limited Empirical Data:** While the study effectively uses document analysis and theoretical frameworks, the lack of primary data collection—such as interviews with Baitulmal officers, beneficiaries, or field practitioners—limits its practical insights into how these policies are applied in day-to-day operations.
2. **Narrow Case Study Focus:** The paper primarily focuses on the Negeri Sembilan Islamic Religious Council (MAINS). A broader comparative analysis, including multiple states in Malaysia, would have offered a more comprehensive view of the practices and challenges faced by various councils.
3. **Underexplored Impact of Technology:** The research briefly mentions modern issues like cryptocurrency and online debts, but it doesn't dive into how technology is influencing the management of Muslim property, an area that is becoming increasingly relevant in today's digital age.
4. **Lack of Focus on Public Awareness:** The paper could benefit from a more detailed examination of public awareness of Baitulmal's role and how the public can better access these services, which is crucial for effective asset management and distribution.

Significance:

This research is highly significant, particularly in the context of Malaysia's dual legal system—combining Islamic and civil law—where the role of Baitulmal is pivotal in managing Muslim property. The paper's focus on practical aspects such as debt settlement, estate redemption, and unclaimed property helps clarify the challenges facing local authorities in administering Islamic law. It underscores the need for clear procedures and efficient management systems to ensure that the resources within Baitulmal benefit the Muslim community effectively.

The study also highlights broader issues such as the challenges of managing unclaimed property and debtors' money, which have significant socio-economic implications for the Muslim community. This makes the paper valuable for legal scholars, Islamic finance practitioners, and policymakers working towards better governance of Muslim assets in line with Islamic principles.

Recommendations for Publication:

The paper is recommended for publication with some revisions:

1. **Empirical Data Inclusion:** The study would benefit from incorporating primary data, such as interviews or surveys with Baitulmal officials and beneficiaries, to provide a more holistic perspective on the real-world applications of the practices discussed.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

2. **Broader Comparative Study:** Including examples from other Islamic religious councils in Malaysia would enhance the generalizability of the findings and provide a broader perspective on the management of Muslim property across the country.
3. **Exploration of Technological Impacts:** A more detailed discussion on how technology (e.g., digital assets, online debt management) affects the management of Muslim property could significantly enrich the paper, making it more relevant to current and future trends in asset management.
4. **Focus on Public Engagement:** The paper could also benefit from an examination of public outreach and engagement efforts to ensure that the community is well-informed about their rights and the functions of Baitulmal.

This paper offers a valuable contribution to the field of Islamic property management by analyzing Baitulmal's role in managing crucial property types. While the paper is academically strong and theoretically sound, it could benefit from incorporating empirical research and addressing emerging issues such as the influence of technology on asset management. With these minor revisions, the paper would be a significant resource for scholars, policymakers, and institutions involved in the management of Muslim-owned assets and the welfare of the Muslim community.

Final Recommendation: *Recommended for publication with minor revisions.*