

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-50608

Date: 11-03-2025

Title: PROXIMAL TIBIA NON-UNION WITH IPSILATERAL FRESH FRACTURE OF MID-SHAFT OF TIBIA: A CASE REPORT AND REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Recommendation:

Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Dr Aamina

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The case report "Proximal Tibia Non-Union with Ipsilateral Fresh Fracture of Mid-Shaft of Tibia: A Case Report and Review of Literature" provides a comprehensive and detailed account of a rare and complex orthopedic case. The report effectively outlines the clinical presentation, surgical procedure, and post-operative outcomes, contributing valuable insights to the existing literature on tibial fractures and their management.

Abstract and Keywords

The abstract succinctly captures the essence of the case, highlighting the challenges posed by proximal tibial non-union in conjunction with an ipsilateral tibial shaft fracture. The keywords are relevant and accurately represent the core themes of the study, ensuring appropriate indexing for future reference.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Introduction

The introduction provides a clear background on proximal tibial fractures and the associated risks of non-union. It effectively explains the role of vascularity, trauma, and bone quality in the healing process. The discussion on the conventional treatment of tibial shaft fractures and the challenges posed by concurrent non-union adds depth to the case presentation. The rationale for the use of Enders nails, despite their relative stability, is well-supported with a focus on biological healing and callus formation.

Case Presentation

The clinical description of the patient, including history, symptoms, and radiological findings, is detailed and well-organized. The report effectively conveys the complexity of the case by discussing the presence of multiple fracture fragments and their implications for surgical management. The inclusion of a thorough clinical examination adds further clarity to the case. The radiological findings, supported by X-rays and CT scans, provide essential diagnostic information, reinforcing the severity of the condition.

Surgical Procedure

The surgical approach is well-documented, describing each step in a logical sequence. The use of separate incisions to address the proximal tibial non-union and tibial shaft fracture demonstrates a strategic approach to fracture fixation. The description of fibular osteotomy, excision of fibrous tissue, and freshening of fracture sites illustrates the meticulous preparation undertaken before fixation. The use of multiple locking compression plates and cancellous bone grafting to enhance stability is well-explained. Additionally, the rationale for using Enders nails for the mid-shaft fracture is clearly stated, emphasizing the advantages in this particular scenario.

Post-Operative Management and Outcome

The post-operative course, including the application of a below-knee plaster slab, early passive mobilization, and stepwise progression to full weight-bearing, is clearly outlined. The inclusion of follow-up X-rays demonstrating progressive union provides objective evidence of successful treatment. The improvement in knee range of motion and the patient's ability to perform daily activities without pain further substantiate the positive clinical outcome.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Conclusion

The case report effectively demonstrates a successful approach to managing a rare and challenging orthopedic condition. The thorough documentation of surgical techniques, post-operative care, and clinical outcomes makes it a valuable contribution to orthopedic literature.

Overall Assessment

The report is well-structured, comprehensive, and clinically relevant. The discussion integrates both surgical principles and practical considerations, making it informative for orthopedic surgeons dealing with complex tibial fractures. The stepwise approach to management, along with radiological and functional outcomes, provides strong support for the chosen surgical strategy.