

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 50608

Date: 10/03/2025

Title: "Proximal Tibia Non-Union with Ipsilateral Fresh Fracture of Mid-Shaft of Tibia: A Case Report and Review of Literature"

Recommendation:

- ✓ Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 12/03/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This paper presents a well-documented and rare case of proximal tibia non-union with an ipsilateral mid-shaft tibial fracture, successfully treated with a combination of locking plates and Enders nails. The surgical strategy is meticulously outlined, supported by radiographic evidence and a literature review. However, further discussion on alternative treatment modalities and long-term functional outcomes would enhance the paper's clinical relevance. Overall, this case study contributes valuable insights into managing complex tibial fractures and reinforces the importance of a structured, multidisciplinary approach to orthopedic trauma.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths of the Paper

- 1. Comprehensive Case Presentation:** The study effectively presents a rare and complex case involving proximal tibia non-union along with an ipsilateral tibial mid-shaft fracture. Detailed descriptions of the patient's history, clinical findings, radiological assessments, and surgical interventions provide valuable insights for orthopedic surgeons.
- 2. Well-Structured Surgical Approach:** The methodology is clearly outlined, with a step-by-step explanation of the surgical procedures, including fibular osteotomy, excision of fibrous tissue, freshening of fracture ends, and the use of locking plates and Enders nails. The use of fluoroscopy guidance, anatomical reduction techniques, and postoperative rehabilitation strategies are well-explained.
- 3. Effective Use of Imaging and Follow-Up:** The inclusion of X-ray images at different stages of treatment (preoperative, intraoperative, and follow-up) enhances the understanding of fracture healing. The follow-up data demonstrate a successful outcome, with full weight-bearing achieved by four months.
- 4. Strong Literature Support:** The paper is well-referenced, citing studies on tibial fractures, non-union risks, and treatment strategies. Comparative analysis with previous research helps validate the chosen surgical approach.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Areas for Improvement

- Limited Discussion on Alternative Treatment Options:** While the chosen method (locking plates with bone grafting and Enders nails) is well-documented, alternative fixation methods such as Ilizarov external fixation or hybrid fixation techniques could be briefly discussed.
- Long-Term Outcomes Not Explored:** The paper reports successful fracture union at four months, but there is no discussion on longer-term functional outcomes, such as return to full activity, knee stability, or potential complications like post-traumatic arthritis.
- Minimal Patient-Specific Factors:** While the case is described in detail, more information about the patient's bone quality, comorbidities (e.g., diabetes, smoking history), and lifestyle factors could provide a broader context for treatment planning.