



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-50662

Date: 17-03-2025

Title: From Stage to Screen: Exploring Directorial Approaches on Adapting Musicals to Film

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Mir Jaffar

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

This study presents a comprehensive exploration of the directorial challenges and methodologies involved in adapting stage musicals into film. The research effectively underscores the inherent complexities of transferring a medium that thrives on live performance, spatial constraints, and audience interaction into the cinematic format, which is defined by its visual storytelling, editing techniques, and immersive experience. The analysis successfully highlights the need for innovation in directorial approaches, advocating for a departure from traditional realist cinema toward a more experimental and avant-garde aesthetic.

The paper's abstract concisely introduces the study's focus and presents a compelling argument for the necessity of a directorial "laboratory" that incorporates avant-garde theories and practices. The discussion is well-supported by references to 20th-century cinema, theater, and music, providing a strong foundation for its claims. The keywords effectively encapsulate the core themes of the study, ensuring clarity in academic and professional discourse.

One of the study's strengths lies in its articulation of the musical as a multi-stylistic and multi-plot phenomenon, emphasizing its fluid nature and vulnerability to artistic reinterpretation. The argument that traditional realist cinema poses limitations in effectively translating the essence of a stage musical to film

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

is convincingly made, reinforced by the discussion of genre hybridity and the role of aestheticization. The inclusion of experimental cinematic techniques—such as extreme angles, axis-breaking movements, and jump cuts—demonstrates the author's thorough understanding of film language and its potential application in musical adaptations.

Furthermore, the paper effectively engages with theoretical perspectives, particularly in discussing rhythm as a unifying force between the "realistic" and "musical-choreographic" elements of a film musical. The reference to Sergei Eisenstein's concept of "pause" and the integration of T. Grodal's research on rhythm strengthens the study's argument by providing concrete theoretical backing. The emphasis on tempo-rhythm as a fundamental tool for directorial decision-making is particularly insightful, offering a practical framework for approaching musical adaptations beyond conventional storytelling techniques.

Another notable strength is the discussion of the limitations of Hollywood's approach to musical adaptations. The analysis of how American independent filmmakers employ experimental techniques primarily as "special effects" rather than as core narrative tools provides a critical perspective on mainstream filmmaking practices. The study's call for a more immersive and integrated approach to musical storytelling is compelling and well-argued.

In summary, this paper is a thought-provoking and well-researched contribution to the discourse on film musicals. It successfully advocates for a shift in directorial approaches by emphasizing the need for innovation and experimentation. The discussion is both theoretically grounded and practically oriented, making it relevant for filmmakers, scholars, and students in film and theater studies. The study's interdisciplinary approach, drawing from music, theater, and cinema, enhances its scholarly impact and broadens its applicability in academic and professional settings.