



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 50762

Date: 22/03/2025

Title: "Dentigerous Cyst Encompassing the Hemi-Maxilla: A Case Report"

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

| Rating | Excel. | Good | Fair | Poor |
|----------------|--------|------|------|------|
| Originality | | ✓ | | |
| Techn. Quality | | ✓ | | |
| Clarity | | ✓ | | |
| Significance | | ✓ | | |

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 24/03/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This case report effectively highlights the diagnosis and surgical management of a rare dentigerous cyst involving the maxillary sinus. The use of CBCT imaging for diagnosis and the Caldwell-Luc surgical approach for treatment is well-documented.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths of the Study

- **Rare Case Documentation:** The paper presents a unique case of an ectopic third molar within the maxillary sinus, contributing valuable clinical insights.
- **Comprehensive Diagnostic Approach:** The study includes detailed radiographic imaging (OPG and CBCT), which enhances diagnostic accuracy.
- **Clear Surgical Protocol:** The step-by-step description of the Caldwell-Luc procedure provides valuable guidance for clinicians.
- **Well-Supported by Literature:** The paper includes relevant references, comparing findings with previous studies on dentigerous cysts and ectopic teeth.
- **Successful Clinical Outcome:** The case demonstrates effective management with a positive post-surgical recovery, reinforcing the chosen treatment approach.

Weaknesses of the Study

- **Single Case Report:** Since this is a single case, the findings may not be widely generalizable to all patients with dentigerous cysts.
- **Limited Discussion on Alternative Treatments:** While marsupialization is briefly mentioned, a more in-depth comparison with alternative techniques (e.g., endoscopic approaches) could enhance the discussion.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **No Long-Term Follow-Up Data:** The report only tracks short-term recovery; long-term outcomes (e.g., recurrence, sinus complications) remain unknown.
- **Minor Typographical Errors:** There are spelling and grammatical errors (e.g., “assosiated” instead of “associated”), which could be corrected for better readability.