



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-50816

Date: 29-03-2025

Title: Vanishing Voices: Exploring the Contribution and Decline of Birhor Oral Traditions in the context of Indian Knowledge System

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Mir Jaffar

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Abstract

The abstract effectively introduces the study's central theme, highlighting the significance of the Birhor tribe's oral traditions within the broader Indian knowledge system. It presents a well-structured overview of the challenges threatening this tradition, including globalization, western influences, and the generational gap. The research objective is clearly stated, emphasizing both the contribution of Birhor oral traditions and the factors contributing to their decline. Additionally, the abstract underscores the urgency of preserving this indigenous knowledge while maintaining a balanced academic tone. The key terms provide a concise representation of the core themes explored in the study.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Introduction

The introduction provides a strong theoretical foundation by contextualizing the Indian knowledge system and its categorization into literary and non-literary traditions. The discussion on the oral transmission of the Vedas, the Gurukul system, and the epics Ramayana and Mahabharata reinforces the historical importance of oral traditions in Indian culture. The study effectively integrates scholarly perspectives, such as those of Mahadevan et al. (2023) and Cenker (1982), to substantiate its claims. The explanation of Shravan, Manan, and Nidhidyan within the Gurukul system adds depth to the understanding of oral knowledge transmission.

The transition from the broader Indian oral tradition to the specific case of the Birhor tribe is seamless. The description of the Birhor people's oral heritage, including their knowledge of hunting, fishing, rituals, and cultural practices, provides concrete examples of their contribution to the indigenous knowledge system. The study also highlights the factors leading to the erosion of this tradition, citing external cultural influences and generational shifts. The references to scholars like Bandyopadhyay (2015) and Bose (2024) lend credibility to these claims.

Overall Assessment

The paper is well-structured and presents a compelling analysis of the Birhor oral traditions within the Indian knowledge system. It successfully establishes the importance of oral knowledge transmission, both historically and within contemporary indigenous communities. The research is grounded in relevant literature, and the discussion is clear and coherent. The study effectively highlights the impact of external influences and the generational gap on the preservation of Birhor traditions. By addressing both the contributions and challenges facing this oral tradition, the paper contributes meaningfully to the discourse on indigenous knowledge preservation.