

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-51069

Date: 17-04-2025

Title: FUNCTIONAL OUTCOME AND COMPLICATION SPECTRUM OF PANTALAR ARTHRODESIS VIA RETROGRADE INTRAMEDULLARY NAIL IN ANKLE INSTABILITY AND ARTHRITIS: A prospective 30 Patients Observational Study

Recommendation:

Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Dr Aamina

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Title:

The title is precise and comprehensive. It effectively communicates the nature of the study, surgical technique, pathology, and patient sample. The inclusion of both "functional outcome" and "complication spectrum" sets the expectation for a balanced clinical analysis.

Abstract:

The abstract is well-structured and informative. It clearly presents the background, objective, methodology, results, and conclusion of the study. Key metrics such as AOFAS and VAS scores, union rates, and complication percentages are clearly stated, offering readers a quick but thorough understanding of the study's scope and findings. The use of specific values strengthens the abstract's impact and demonstrates a data-driven approach.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Introduction:

The introduction establishes a solid context for the clinical problem. It provides a concise rationale for using retrograde intramedullary nailing in pantalar arthrodesis and articulates the relevance of this approach in a post-traumatic population. It also highlights the gap in existing literature, justifying the study's purpose. The tone is scholarly and focused, suitable for a clinical research audience.

Methods:

Although this section is briefly mentioned in the excerpt provided, it is evident that the study follows a prospective observational design with an adequate sample size ($n=30$). The inclusion of standardized follow-up intervals and validated assessment tools (AOFAS, VAS) suggests a methodologically sound approach. The mention of radiographic evaluation and complication tracking further supports the comprehensiveness of the study.

Results:

The results are clearly presented, highlighting significant improvements in functional scores and pain reduction over time. The reporting of union rates and time to union is concise and relevant. The complication rate is clearly stated and contextualized (6 patients, 20%), giving a transparent view of the outcome spectrum. The inclusion of standard deviations reinforces the statistical validity of the findings.

Discussion & Conclusion:

The conclusion succinctly ties together the observed results and their clinical implications. It positions the technique as effective and safe, especially in complex cases of post-traumatic ankle pathology. The comparison with contemporary literature, although not expanded in this excerpt, is mentioned and shows awareness of broader clinical benchmarks. The conclusion is well-balanced and appropriately cautious, acknowledging the strength of the findings while avoiding overstatement.

Language and Style:

The writing is professional, clear, and appropriately technical for an orthopedic or surgical audience. The clinical terminology is used accurately, and the structure is coherent and systematic. The formatting and clarity of numerical data improve readability and enhance the study's presentation.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Scientific and Clinical Merit:

This study addresses a clinically relevant and challenging issue. It contributes meaningfully to the limited body of prospective evidence on pantalar arthrodesis using retrograde intramedullary nailing. The focus on both functional outcome and complications makes it highly applicable to real-world surgical practice.

Overall Evaluation:

This study is a valuable and well-executed clinical investigation into pantalar arthrodesis in a post-traumatic context. The prospective design, structured follow-up, and dual emphasis on outcome and complications enhance its clinical relevance. The results are promising and clearly presented, offering a significant contribution to the surgical management of ankle arthritis and instability.
