

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-51718

Date: 21-05-2025

Title: Knee pigmented villonodular synovitis with an atypical multi-system syndrome : case report

Recommendation:

Accept as it is.....YES.....

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			√	
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Dr Aamina

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

General Overview:

The case report presents a comprehensive and well-organized examination of a rare presentation of pigmented villonodular synovitis (PVNS) of the knee in conjunction with an atypical multi-systemic syndrome. The document adheres to the SCARE criteria, ensuring clarity and completeness in case reporting. The structured layout with detailed sections—from patient history to diagnostic reasoning and management—provides a thorough narrative useful for both clinical understanding and academic reference.

Abstract and Keywords:

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The keywords selected effectively highlight the main medical and diagnostic aspects of the case, including PVNS, Noonan syndrome, Rasopathies, and other associated systemic conditions. The abstract succinctly introduces the rarity of PVNS, the association with multi-systemic syndromes, and the purpose of the report to enhance understanding of this condition.

Background:

The background section offers a concise and informative summary of PVNS, including its epidemiology, pathophysiology, and known genetic associations. The mention of chromosome 1p13 translocations and CSF1 overexpression provides a valuable molecular insight. The discussion about its association with various syndromes such as Noonan syndrome and Rasopathies sets a relevant context for the presented case.

Case Presentation:

The patient's demographic details, medical history, family history, and presenting symptoms are clearly outlined. The progression from initial symptoms to hospital referral is detailed, allowing readers to understand the clinical course and complexity of the case. Noteworthy is the inclusion of multi-system involvement, adding depth to the clinical picture.

Clinical findings are described precisely, with attention to relevant orthopedic signs and general patient condition. The inclusion of joint-specific signs like patellar burying and positive patellar shock is particularly useful for diagnostic correlation.

Diagnostic Assessment and Management:

While only part of the diagnostic assessment and management sections are visible, the inclusion of diagnostic reasoning and both medical and surgical management indicate a comprehensive approach. The focus on interdisciplinary care for a complex case is evident.

Language and Presentation:

The language is clear, professional, and appropriate for a clinical case report. The organization into well-defined sections enhances readability and ease of reference.

Contribution and Relevance:

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

This case report contributes meaningfully to the limited literature on PVNS associated with atypical multi-system syndromes. By documenting an uncommon presentation and its clinical features, the report provides valuable insights for clinicians who may encounter similar complex cases.

Final Assessment:

This case report is well-prepared, informative, and clinically relevant. It effectively balances detailed clinical information with broader pathological and genetic contexts. The adherence to SCARE guidelines strengthens its quality as an academic and clinical resource.