

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 51767

Date: 21/05/2025

Title: "Prognostic utility of GATA-3 and CK-14 Immunohistochemical expression in urothelial carcinoma of urinary bladder and its clinicopathological correlation"

Recommendation:

- ✓ Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 22/05/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This study underscores the potential usefulness of GATA-3 and CK-14 as immunohistochemical markers in differentiating tumor grades and invasiveness in urothelial carcinoma of the bladder. GATA-3 shows promise as a favorable prognostic marker associated with lower-grade, non-invasive tumors, while CK-14 correlates with more aggressive tumor features. If validated in larger, multi-center studies, these markers could aid pathologists and clinicians in planning tailored management strategies and prognostication.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths:

- **Relevant Subject Matter:** The study addresses the important role of GATA-3 and CK-14 as diagnostic and prognostic biomarkers in urothelial carcinoma, which is critical given the disease's clinical heterogeneity.
- **Clear Objectives and Methods:** The research has well-defined aims to evaluate the expression of specific markers and their association with tumor grade and invasion, utilizing immunohistochemistry, a reliable technique.
- **Correlation with Clinicopathological Features:** The study demonstrates significant correlations between biomarker expression and tumor characteristics such as grade, invasion, and survival outcomes, which enhances its clinical relevance.
- **Sample Size:** Inclusion of 80 cases provides a reasonable sample for statistical analysis in a single-institution setting.

Weaknesses:

- **Limited Literature Context:** Although some comparisons are made, the discussion lacks an in-depth review of existing literature on the prognostic value of GATA-3 and CK-14, which could strengthen the conclusions.
- **Single-Center Study:** The findings may have limited generalizability due to being from a single institution and lacking validation in external cohorts.
- **Short Follow-up Data:** The study mentions survival correlations but does not specify the follow-up duration or survival analysis methodology in detail.
- **Lack of Molecular Analysis:** The study focuses solely on immunohistochemical expression without investigating underlying genetic or molecular mechanisms that might explain the biomarker behavior.
- **Potential Bias:** Inclusion and exclusion criteria, as well as data on treatment modalities, are lightly addressed, and potential selection bias cannot be fully ruled out.