ISSN: 2320-5407
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com
ISSN NO. 2320-5407

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 51808 Date: 22/05/2025

Title: Partial Congenital Arhinia: A Case Report

Recommendation:
✓ Accept as it is .....
Accept after minor revision.....
Accept after major revision .....
Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath Date: 24/05/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:
The paper effectively highlights the rarity and severity of congenital partial arhinia, emphasizing the critical need for early detection through prenatal screening, especially in resource-limited settings. It underscores that multidisciplinary management is essential to improve neonatal outcomes. Despite its limitations as a single case report, it adds meaningful knowledge and advocates for better prenatal care and future research into the etiology and management of this rare anomaly.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths:

1. **Rare Case Documentation:** The paper contributes valuable insights into an extremely rare condition, partial congenital arhinia, adding to the limited literature on this topic.
2. **Comprehensive Clinical Description:** It provides detailed clinical, radiological, and surgical findings, including prenatal ultrasound and postnatal examination, which are critical for understanding the presentation.
3. **Highlighting Diagnostic Challenges:** The authors emphasize the importance of early prenatal diagnosis using ultrasound and fetal MRI, which is crucial for timely management.
4. **Call for Multidisciplinary Approach:** The paper advocates for a team-based strategy involving obstetricians, radiologists, neonatologists, and surgeons, essential for managing such complex anomalies.
5. **Contextual Relevance:** It discusses the case in a resource-limited setting, underscoring challenges faced in developing countries and the need for improved prenatal care.

Weaknesses:

1. **Limited Sample Size:** As a single case report, the findings cannot be generalized, and conclusions about prognosis and management strategies remain limited.
2. **Lack of Genetic Testing:** The paper mentions genetic factors like SMCHD1 mutations but notes that such testing was unavailable for this case, limiting insights into potential genetic causes.
3. **Short Follow-Up:** The patient's outcome was unfavorable, with early neonatal death; long-term outcome data or insights into potential interventions are lacking.
4. **Absence of Therapeutic Strategies:** The report does not explore surgical or medical management options for partial arhinia, which could be valuable for future cases.
5. **Limited Literature Review:** While it discusses associated anomalies and embryology, the literature review could be more extensive to provide deeper context on management and prognosis.