

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-52324

Date: 17-06-2025

Title: Between Faith, Family, and Fear: An Ethnographic Study of Honour-Related Violence in Muslim Communities in Western Uttar Pradesh

Recommendation:

Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		√		
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity			√	
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Dr Abdul Hameed Shah

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Content Evaluation:

The article presents a critical and timely intervention into the discourse on honour-related violence in India by shifting the analytical focus from its dominant association with Hindu caste frameworks to the underexplored terrain of Muslim communities in Western Uttar Pradesh. The research question is clearly articulated and contextually anchored in the aftermath of the 2013 Muzaffarnagar riots—a moment of intensified communal polarization.

The abstract effectively encapsulates the scope and methodology of the study, outlining the multi-sited ethnographic approach and the diverse range of sources including interviews, participant observation, and document analysis. The emphasis on *izzat* as both a familial and communal construct adds depth to the analysis, highlighting how honour functions not only as a private value but as a public and politicised discourse.

The findings are compelling, particularly in how they illustrate the dynamic and strategic deployment of honour to enforce gender norms, suppress dissent, and manage interfaith interactions. The discussion on the legitimising role of clerics and the complicity of state institutions adds critical nuance, moving the analysis beyond community practices to structural dimensions of power.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Methodology and Theoretical Contribution:

The ethnographic methodology is robust, offering rich, grounded insights into the lived realities of honour regulation. The choice of field sites—Muzaffarnagar, Bijnor, and Shamli—enhances the study's relevance by situating it in areas marked by both patriarchal control and communal tension.

The article's theoretical contribution lies in its reframing of honour as a relational and politicised construct, rather than a residual tradition. It successfully integrates feminist, intersectional, and political perspectives to explain how honour-related violence serves as a disciplinary mechanism shaped by gender, religion, caste-like biradari dynamics, and communal anxieties.

Language and Style:

The writing is clear, scholarly, and accessible. It maintains a critical tone without being polemical, and the terminology used—such as “state complicity,” “intersectional,” and “communal strategy of control”—is both precise and analytically rigorous.

Overall Assessment:

This is a well-conceived and executed study that addresses a significant lacuna in the literature on honour-related violence in India. Its interdisciplinary approach, grounded fieldwork, and intersectional analysis contribute meaningfully to debates on gender, community, and violence in contemporary South Asia. The study stands out for its empirical richness and theoretical innovation.