

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: **IJAR-52495**

Date: June 27, 2025

Title: Cyclotomic Cosets in The Ring $R_{(2p^n q^m)} = GF(l)[x]/(x^{(2p^n q^m)} - 1)$

Recommendation:

Major changes

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			√	
Techn. Quality				√
Clarity				√
Significance				√

Reviewer Name: simon wels

Date: June 27, 2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

The current submission doesn't look like a manuscript. Thus, the author or authors should make sure the paper meets journal manuscript requirements before sending it to a journal for publication.

Detailed Reviewer's Rep

For the reasons outlined below,

1. The use of a large equation in the title makes it unclear.
2. “--- is a primitive root both modulo ---” has no sense.
3. The introduction comes across as a lecture note introduction rather than a research paper introduction.
4. There is an unnecessary redundancy of the word 'Let' in the first paragraph of the introduction part.
5. Poor literature review.
6. There is spacing and typo problems throughout the document.
7. The biggest weakness is the **lack of proofs for Lemma 2.2 and Theorem 2.1**. Labeling them as "Trivial" severely undermines the credibility and completeness of the paper. These are critical results that require formal and detailed derivations.
8. In the literature review, only references [4] and [5] are cited, but the reference section lists nine (9) references.