ISSN: 2320-5407



International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: **IJAR-525605** Date: 04-07-2025

Title: UNRAVELING THE JOURNEY TO INSULA - A RARE CASE REPORT OF THE INSULAR CARCINOMA OF THYROID

Recommendation:	Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Accept as it is	Originality			⋖	
Accept after minor revision	Techn. Quality			<	
Accept after major revision	Clarity			<	
Do not accept (Reasons below)	Significance			<	

Reviewer Name: Dr Aamina

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

General Comments:

The manuscript presents a focused and informative case report on insular carcinoma of the thyroid, a rare and clinically significant subtype of poorly differentiated thyroid carcinoma. The abstract succinctly outlines the pathological, clinical, and therapeutic dimensions of this malignancy, emphasizing its aggressive behavior and intermediate position between well-differentiated and anaplastic carcinomas. The description of insular architecture, mitotic activity, and necrosis captures the core histopathological features effectively.

The overview of its epidemiology, clinical presentation, and diagnostic modalities is well integrated. The manuscript emphasizes the aggressive nature of the disease, its propensity for metastasis, and the challenges in prognosis—elements that are essential for awareness among clinicians and pathologists alike. The mention of osteopetrosis as a metastatic site is notable and contributes to the rarity and complexity of the case.

The diagnostic strategy involving histological examination and immunohistochemistry is consistent with current oncopathological protocols. The therapeutic approach combining total thyroidectomy, radioactive iodine therapy, and adjunctive radiotherapy or chemotherapy reflects a comprehensive management plan aligned with standard practices for poorly differentiated thyroid malignancies.

The introduction appropriately contextualizes the disease historically and pathologically. The reference to Carcangiu's original description in 1984 and the rarity of the tumor in the general population provides a solid academic foundation for the report. The manuscript also effectively communicates the importance of early detection and aggressive treatment in influencing outcomes, even for rare cancers such as insular carcinoma.

ISSN: 2320-5407

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Recommendation:

This manuscript presents a well-documented and educational case on an unusual thyroid malignancy. It holds value for oncologists, surgeons, pathologists, and endocrine specialists. The case is suitable for publication in journals dealing with oncology, endocrine pathology, or rare case reports in surgical literature.