

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-53277

Date: 14-08-2025

Title: Investigation of the Collective Memory of Urban Residents: A Case of an University Healthcare Campus

Recommendation:

Accept as it isYES.....

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Khursheed Sultan

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

General Overview

The article examines the intersection of healthcare facility renewal, urban planning, and collective memory, focusing on the Çapa Healthcare Campus in Istanbul's Historic Peninsula. It approaches the subject through a multidisciplinary lens that combines urban studies, healthcare management, architecture, and sociology. The study is timely, as it addresses the challenges faced by historic city centers where healthcare campuses have long served both medical and educational roles, yet now encounter functional and spatial constraints.

Abstract Evaluation

The abstract clearly articulates the study's objectives, scope, and methodology. It outlines the main problem—the functional obsolescence of centrally located healthcare facilities due to physical constraints—and explains the implications for both hospital users and the surrounding urban community. The mention of collective and spatial memory situates the research within a sociological framework, while the reference to survey data analysis and literature review indicates a balanced methodological approach. The inclusion of the Çapa Healthcare Campus as a case study provides a concrete focal point for the discussion.

Introduction Evaluation

The introduction effectively sets the context by linking the growth and transformation of cities since the 19th century to the evolution of healthcare infrastructure. It frames healthcare facilities as critical components of the urban organism and highlights the continuous renewal and modernization required to maintain their educational, research, and service roles. The text draws a clear connection between spatial obsolescence, the pressures of modernization, and the broader urban and architectural challenges involved in redeveloping long-standing medical campuses.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Thematic Scope and Relevance

The study addresses multiple interconnected themes—urban development, healthcare service provision, historical preservation, and the sociological significance of place. The notion of “collective memory” as applied to healthcare facilities is particularly noteworthy, as it expands the discussion beyond technical or functional considerations to include the symbolic and experiential dimensions of urban life.

Methodological Approach

The research combines literature review with empirical data collection through surveys conducted among healthcare professionals, patients, and their companions. This multi-perspective approach ensures that the analysis captures the viewpoints of various stakeholders directly affected by the relocation or renewal of healthcare facilities. The case study method allows for in-depth exploration of the specific historical and urban context of the Çapa Healthcare Campus.

Findings and Analytical Strength

Although the abstract does not present detailed statistical results, it indicates that the analysis identifies key reasons for preserving the hospital in its current location. These reasons are likely linked to both functional needs and the preservation of spatial identity and urban memory. The study's integration of these findings with concepts of collective and spatial memory strengthens its analytical depth.

Overall Assessment

The article is coherent, contextually rich, and well-grounded in both theoretical and empirical frameworks. It contributes to the discourse on healthcare campus planning by incorporating social and cultural dimensions alongside technical and spatial considerations. The use of the Çapa Healthcare Campus as a case study provides a tangible context for exploring how urban residents' collective memory influences perceptions of healthcare facility location and renewal.