

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-53508

Date: 22/08/2025

Title: "A Complex Case of MPFL Reconstruction with Semitendinosus Autograft for a Traumatic Patellar Dislocation with a Full Thickness MPFL Tear in a Young Female"

### Recommendation:

- ✓ Accept as it is .....
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision .....
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 23/08/2025

### Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

The paper concludes that MPFL reconstruction using semitendinosus autograft in a young female with traumatic patellar dislocation and full-thickness MPFL tear can yield satisfactory functional recovery. The case underscores the importance of accurate diagnosis and anatomical reconstruction to prevent recurrence and restore knee stability.

### Reviewer's Comment / Report

#### Strengths:

- **Detailed Case Presentation:** The paper provides an in-depth description of a rare clinical scenario involving full-thickness MPFL tear with traumatic dislocation, including physical examination, MRI findings, surgical approach, and postoperative outcomes.
- **Use of Autograft (Semitendinosus):** The choice of autograft is well-justified, given its proven effectiveness in restoring stability.
- **Clear Outcome Reporting:** The follow-up demonstrates significant functional improvement, with the patient regaining mobility and walking ability.
- **Literature Integration:** The paper references multiple studies about MPFL anatomy, injury rates, and reconstruction techniques, contextualizing the case within current orthopedic practices.

#### Weaknesses:

- **Limited Generalizability:** As a single case report, the findings cannot be generalized to all patients with similar injuries.
- **Lack of Long-term Follow-up:** Postoperative results are primarily short-term; longer follow-up would provide better insight into the durability of the reconstruction.
- **Absence of Comparative Data:** The report doesn't compare different reconstruction techniques or graft choices, which could have strengthened the discussion.
- **Insufficient Details on Rehabilitation:** Postoperative rehabilitation protocols are briefly mentioned; a more detailed outline could help replicate outcomes.