

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: **IJAR-53592**

Date: 30/08/2025

**Title:** Coffin Birth: A rare case report

### Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....  
 Accept after minor revision.....  
 Accept after major revision **YES**.....  
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	<b>YES</b>			
Techn. Quality		<b>YES</b>		
Clarity	<b>YES</b>			
Significance	<b>YES</b>			

Reviewer Name: Emmanuel KUBANA

**Date:** 30/08/2025

### Reviewer's Comment

The manuscript presents a rare and well-documented case of coffin birth (postmortem fetal extrusion) following maternal death due to hanging. The topic is unusual, relevant in forensic medicine, and contributes to awareness of a phenomenon that may otherwise raise suspicion of malpractice or foul play. The manuscript is generally comprehensive but requires improvement in structure, clarity, and referencing.

### *Detailed Reviewer's Report*

#### Strengths:

- The case is clearly described with detailed forensic observations.
- Historical and global perspectives on coffin birth are incorporated.
- The manuscript highlights the forensic significance of the phenomenon in ruling out foul play.

#### Weaknesses & Areas for Improvement:

- **Language & Grammar:** The text contains grammatical errors, inconsistent tense use, and some colloquial expressions that should be revised for scientific clarity.
- **Abstract:** Needs restructuring to follow standard format (background, case description, conclusion). Currently, it reads more like a case summary.
- **Case Report Section:** Very detailed but overly descriptive; some repetition should be reduced, and the findings presented in a more systematic format (e.g., external findings, internal findings, fetus findings).
- **Figures:** Mentioned in text (Fig 1, Fig 2) but images are missing in the provided file. Ensure proper inclusion with ethical clearance.

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Discussion:** While informative, it would benefit from more recent literature and a deeper forensic interpretation linking the case to practical implications in India.
- **References:** Several references are mentioned with superscripts (e.g., 1, 2, 3) but not listed at the end. A complete reference list in appropriate style (e.g., Vancouver) must be added.
- **Conclusion:** Needs tightening to focus on the forensic importance of distinguishing coffin birth from suspicious circumstances.

### Recommendation:

**Major Revision** before acceptance.

The case is valuable and publishable, but significant improvements in writing, organization, and referencing are required to meet scientific publication standards.