



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-53738

Date: 09/09/2025

Title: "A Rare Presentation of Gastric Metastasis from Clear Cell Renal Carcinoma"

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 10/09/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This case report effectively emphasizes the rarity and diagnostic challenge of gastric metastasis from ccRCC. It advocates for a high index of suspicion in patients with previous RCC presenting with gastric lesions and demonstrates the value of multimodal diagnostics. Despite its limitations as a single case, it contributes important clinical knowledge and underscores the importance of accurate diagnosis for appropriate management. Future insights could be expanded with larger case series, long-term follow-up, and molecular analyses.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths:

- Documentation of a Rare Clinical Case:** The paper reports an uncommon metastatic site (gastric) originating from clear cell renal cell carcinoma (ccRCC), enriching the limited existing literature and providing valuable clinical insight.
- Comprehensive Diagnostic Workflow:** It highlights a thorough approach, including radiology (contrast-enhanced CT), endoscopy, histopathology, and immunohistochemistry, which effectively differentiates metastatic ccRCC from primary gastric tumors.
- Clear Presentation of Imaging and Pathology Findings:** The inclusion of detailed radiological and pathological findings enhances reproducibility and understanding.
- Emphasis on Multidisciplinary Management:** The case underscores the importance of multidisciplinary tumor board discussions in complex cases.
- Literature Contextualization:** Well-referenced, placing the case within the broader context of RCC metastasis incidence and typical metastatic patterns.

Weaknesses:

- Limited Scope as a Single Case Report:** While valuable, conclusions are limited to one patient, reducing generalizability.
- Short-term Follow-up:** The paper does not provide long-term outcomes post-surgery or systemic therapy, which limits understanding of prognosis after such metastases.
- Lack of Novel Therapeutic Insights:** The case confirms known diagnostic challenges without proposing new management strategies or discussing emerging therapies.
- Absence of Molecular or Genetic Data:** No molecular profiling is included, which could reveal insights into metastatic behavior or potential targeted treatments.
- Minimal Discussion on Prognosis:** The paper briefly mentions management but does not explore prognosis or survival data specifically related to gastric metastases.
- Minor Editorial Issues:** Some grammatical errors, typos, or awkward phrasing may affect readability.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Suggestions for the Author:

1. **Proofreading and Language Editing:** Conduct a thorough grammatical review to correct typos, grammatical errors, and awkward phrasing (e.g., "performed in 62 November 2020" should be "performed in November 2020"). Use professional editing if necessary.
2. **Consistency in Formatting:** Ensure uniform formatting of references, figure legends, and headings. For example, check spacing and font for consistency.
3. **Clarify and Expand Discussion:** Elaborate on the prognosis and survival data specifically related to gastric metastases of RCC. Discuss any therapeutic options beyond surgery, including systemic therapy and palliative care considerations.
4. **Include Long-term Follow-up Data:** If available, add information about patient follow-up, subsequent disease progression, or survival outcomes.
5. **Consider Adding Molecular Data:** If feasible, include molecular or genetic profiling to enrich the diagnostic information.
6. **Enhance Figures and Tables:** Incorporate annotated images to better display radiological and histological findings.
7. **Update References:** Ensure all references are current, correctly formatted, and complete.