ISSN: 2320-5407
ISSN NO. 2320-5407
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-53761 Date: 10/09/2025

Title: Therapeutic Response of Unani Medicine in the Management of Zaof e Istadgi (Nauooz) (Erectile Dysfunction)

Recommendation:
Accept as it is .....
✓ Accept after minor revision.....
Accept after major revision .....
Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath Date: 10/09/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:
The study concludes that both Unani formulations (Groups A and B) are effective and safe for managing erectile dysfunction, with Group A demonstrating superior responses. These findings are promising but require validation through larger, multi-center studies with longer follow-up periods to confirm efficacy and safety.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

Strengths:
1. **Innovative Approach:** The study explores the efficacy of Unani medicine in managing erectile dysfunction, contributing valuable insights into traditional herbal therapies.
2. **Study Design:** Utilization of a randomized and single-blind approach enhances the credibility of the results.
3. **Detailed Methodology:** The preparation and administration of herbs are described, including dosage and treatment duration.
4. **Statistical Significance:** The results show statistically significant improvements in both treatment groups, with p-values less than 0.00001.
5. **Holistic Evaluation:** Both subjective (SHIM scores, symptoms) and objective (sperm count, libido) parameters were assessed.

Weaknesses:
1. **Sample Size Limitation:** The study involves only 40 participants, which may limit the generalizability of the findings.
2. **Lack of Detailed Mechanistic Insights:** While the efficacy is demonstrated, the biological mechanisms through which the herbs exert their effects are unclear, as acknowledged in the paper.
3. **Short Follow-up Period:** The follow-up is only 90 days; longer-term effects and recurrences are not evaluated.
4. **Potential Bias:** As a single-blind study, there's a risk of observer or participant bias; a double-blind study design would strengthen the findings.
5. **Variability in Herbal Composition:** The exact phytochemical compositions of the herbal formulations are not analyzed or standardized, affecting reproducibility.
6. **Limited Information on Adverse Effects:** The claim that no adverse events were reported warrants caution—larger studies are necessary to substantiate safety.

ISSN: 2320-5407
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Recommendations for the Authors:

1. **Increase Sample Size:** Enroll more participants across multiple centers to enhance the statistical power and generalizability.
2. **Longer Follow-up:** Incorporate follow-up assessments beyond 90 days to evaluate the sustainability of treatment effects.
3. **Mechanistic Studies:** Consider biochemical or pharmacological investigations to elucidate the mechanisms of action.
4. **Blinding:** Implement a double-blind protocol to minimize bias.
5. **Standardization and Phytochemical Analysis:** Quantify active constituents in the herbal preparations to improve reproducibility.
6. **Detailed Reporting of Safety:** Document any minor side effects or adverse reactions more thoroughly, even if none are observed.

Editorial and Language Corrections:

- **Typographical and grammatical errors** are present throughout the document, e.g., inconsistent spacing, spelling mistakes ("Zoaf e Istadgi" should be "Zaof e Istadgi," "Muqawwi e Bah" should be "Muqawwi e Bah," etc.).
- **Sentence Construction:** Several sentences are lengthy and could be simplified for clarity.
- **Consistency:** Maintain consistent terminology (e.g., "Group A" and "Group B" should be uniformly used).
- **Formatting:** Improve uniformity of reference numbering, headings, and figure/table labels.
- **References Section:** Ensure all references are complete and formatted uniformly.