

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 53771

Date: 10/08/2025

Title: Kalibangan: A Testimony to the Indian Tradition of Ancient Urban Planning,

### Recommendation:

Accept

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		√		
Techno. Quality			√	
Clarity			√	
Significance			√	

Reviewer Name: Dr Abdul Haseeb Mir

Date: 10/08/2025

### Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

This is a well-structured and informative article that effectively achieves its primary objective: to present Kalibangan as a premier example of sophisticated ancient Indian urban planning within the Indus Valley Civilization (IVC). The article is strong in its descriptive detail, drawing clear connections between archaeological evidence and the advanced societal structures of the time. It successfully argues that urban planning in ancient India was not accidental but a deliberate, scientific, and holistic process encompassing administrative, social, religious, and economic life.

### Detailed Reviewer's Report

This article, "Kalibangan: A Testimony to the Indian Tradition of Ancient Urban Planning," presents a thorough and well-organized examination of the Kalibangan archaeological site, effectively establishing it as a paramount example of advanced urban planning within the Indus Valley Civilization. The author successfully argues that the city's design was not haphazard but a deliberate, scientific, and integrated process that encompassed administration, social structure, economy, and religion.

The strength of the article lies in its comprehensive and logical structure. It begins by situating Kalibangan within the broader context of the Sarasvati-Sindhu civilization before meticulously detailing its urban features. The description of the city's division into a citadel and a lower town effectively highlights a clear socio-administrative hierarchy. The analysis of the grid-based street system, complete

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

with right-angle intersections and a hierarchy of main roads and smaller lanes, demonstrates a sophisticated understanding of spatial organization. The coverage of architecture—noting the use of standardized bricks, courtyard-centered houses, and private wells—and the extensive, covered drainage system is particularly strong. The author aptly compares this ancient drainage to a modern sewer system, emphasizing its ingenuity. Furthermore, the article commendably moves beyond infrastructure to explore the society's agricultural innovations, such as ploughed fields and double cropping, as well as its religious practices evidenced by fire altars and domestic shrines, providing a holistic view of its advanced culture.

However, the article is hampered by significant technical flaws.

1. The most pressing issue is the pervasive presence of typographical and spelling errors throughout the Hindi text (e.g., "ईन्नत" for "उन्नत", "नवश्व" for "विश्व"). These errors detract from the article's professionalism and can occasionally obscure meaning.
2. The first several references are corrupted and appear as unintelligible characters, rendering them useless. While the included English-language sources from renowned archaeologists like B.B. Lal and Gregory Possehl are relevant and authoritative, their formatting is inconsistent with the corrupted entries. This section requires a complete overhaul to be functional.
3. The article also tends to be repetitive, reiterating points about the planned nature of the city and the significance of certain finds like the fire altars across different sections. Streamlining this content would enhance the paper's conciseness and impact.
4. For a subject as visually driven as urban planning, the absence of maps, site plans, or diagrams is a notable shortcoming. Visual aids would greatly assist the reader in visualizing the grid layout, drainage flow, and architectural descriptions.

Overall, this is a substantively rich and insightful article that effectively achieves its core objective of showcasing Kalibangan's urban sophistication. The author demonstrates a strong command of the archaeological evidence and synthesizes it into a compelling narrative about the advanced nature of ancient Indian civilization. The primary weaknesses are technical and presentational. Addressing the language errors, completely revising the reference section, reducing repetition, and incorporating visual aids would transform this very good paper into an excellent and authoritative resource on the subject.

**Recommendation:** Accept with minor revisions.

.