

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 53793

Date: 11/08/2025

Title: AN ANALYSIS OF AYYUBID MILITARY MANOEUVRES DURING THE BATTLE OF HATTIN BASED ON HISTORICAL SOURCES

Recommendation:

Accept

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		√		
Techno. Quality			√	
Clarity			√	
Significance			√	

Reviewer Name: Dr Abdul Haseeb Mir

Date: 11/08/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

This is a well-structured, clear, and focused academic paper. It successfully achieves its primary goal: to explain the military strategies and historical significance of the Ayyubid victory at the Battle of Hattin, leading to the liberation of Jerusalem (Bayt al-Maqdis). The paper is strong in its use of sources and its narrative clarity but has some limitations in its critical analysis and scope.

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This paper presents a well-structured and clearly focused academic examination of the Ayyubid military strategies that led to Salah al-Din's decisive victory at the Battle of Hattin in 1187 and the subsequent recapture of Jerusalem. The study successfully outlines key tactical and strategic elements employed by the Ayyubid forces, though it occasionally leans toward narrative description over deep critical analysis.

One of the primary strengths of this article is its coherent structure and clear thesis. The author effectively establishes the historical and political context leading up to the battle, highlighting earlier Muslim efforts under the Zengid dynasty and setting the stage for Salah al-Din's campaign. The use of both primary and secondary sources—including classical historians like Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Shaddad, as well as modern scholars such as Karen Armstrong and Carole Hillenbrand—lends credibility and depth to the discussion.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The article also excels in its narrative delivery. It logically sequences events from the casus belli, namely Reynald of Châtillon's violation of truce and attack on a Muslim caravan, to the tactical execution of the battle, and finally to the peaceful conquest of Jerusalem. Important military strategies are clearly identified, such as the use of psychological pressure, exploitation of terrain and weather, and the strategic targeting of Crusader supply lines—especially water sources.

Furthermore, the author does well to emphasize Salah al-Din's leadership and the ethical dimensions of his campaign, including his treatment of prisoners and the civilian population after the victory. This holistic approach adds moral and cultural depth to the military analysis.

Despite its much strength, the article has some limitations.

1. The title suggests a focus on "military maneuvers," which implies a granular, tactical-level examination of troop movements and battlefield decisions. However, the content remains largely strategic and descriptive. More detailed discussion on specific battlefield tactics—such as cavalry movements, arrow volleys, or infantry formations—would have strengthened the military analysis.
2. While the author cites a range of sources, there is limited critical engagement with these texts. The paper would benefit from comparing differing historical accounts or evaluating potential biases in the primary sources. For example, Ibn Shaddad's first-hand account as a companion of Salah al-Din could be contrasted with Western chronicles to offer a more nuanced perspective.
3. The conclusion, though adequate, tends to summarize previously stated points rather than synthesizing new insights or posing broader questions about the long-term impact of Hattin on military tactics or the balance of power in the Crusader campaigns.

Recommendation: Accept with minor revisions.

.