

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-54169

Date: 06-10-2025

Title: Mammary Chondrolipoma: A Rare benign mimicker of Phyllodes tumor.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is
 Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Amina

Reviewer's Comments for Publication

Key Points:

- Rarity:** Chondrolipoma of the breast is extremely rare, with few cases reported in literature.
- Clinical Challenge:** The tumor can mimic more common lesions, especially phyllodes tumor, leading to potential overtreatment if histopathology is not performed.
- Histopathology:**
 - Lobules of mature adipose tissue.
 - Foci of well-formed hyaline cartilage.
 - Presence of smooth muscle bundles confirmed by desmin staining.
 - No malignant features.
- Differential Diagnosis:**
 - Chondroid lipoma (immature cartilage in myxoid stroma).
 - Liposarcoma with chondroid differentiation.
 - Extraskelatal chondrosarcoma.
- Pathogenesis:** Theories include stromal metaplasia or differentiation from pluripotent mesenchymal cells, potentially triggered by long-standing lipomatous lesions.
- Clinical Significance:** Correct recognition prevents unnecessary radical procedures and guides conservative management.

Strengths:

- Clear case presentation with clinical, radiological, and histopathological correlation.
- High-quality figures demonstrating imaging and microscopic findings.
- Comprehensive discussion with differential diagnosis and pathogenesis.
- Highlights the importance of awareness to avoid overtreatment.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Areas for Improvement:

1. **Formatting:** Ensure consistent figure labeling and placement with captions directly below figures.
2. **Literature Review:** A brief summary of all previously reported breast chondrolipoma cases could strengthen the discussion.
3. **MRI Details:** Include contrast enhancement patterns or other radiological features that could help differentiate chondrolipoma from phyllodes tumor.
4. **Grammar & Typographical Errors:** Minor edits needed, e.g., “hypointense on T1 and hyperintense on T2 SPAIR sequences” could clarify for non-radiology readers.

Conclusion:

Mammary chondrolipoma is a rare benign tumor that can mimic phyllodes tumors. Awareness of its distinctive histopathological features, including mature adipose tissue with hyaline cartilage and occasional smooth muscle bundles, is critical for accurate diagnosis and avoiding overtreatment.