

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-54427

Date: 22-10-2025

Title: Quelques aspects psychopathologiques de l' adoption (avec vignettes cliniques du service de pedopsychiatrie de CHU MOHAMMED VI marrakech).

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Amina

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

The manuscript titled "*Quelques aspects psychopathologiques de l'adoption (Avec vignettes cliniques)*" offers a rich and multifaceted exploration of the **psychopathological dimensions of adoption**, integrating **legal, social, and clinical perspectives** with three detailed **vignettes cliniques** from the authors' professional experience at the Ibn Nafis Child Psychiatry Department of CHU Mohamed VI, Marrakech.

The study stands out for its **depth of clinical reflection** and **interdisciplinary analysis**—connecting the juridical framework of *kafala* in Morocco with the emotional, social, and developmental implications of adoption. The integration of **real-world cases** provides authenticity and clinical relevance, highlighting how early trauma, parental expectations, and identity formation intersect within the adoption process.

Strengths

1. Original Contribution:

The paper fills an important gap in the North African context by addressing adoption

REVIEWER'S REPORT

through both **psychodynamic and sociocultural lenses**, an area rarely covered in local psychiatric literature.

2. Clinical Relevance:

The three vignettes are well-chosen and illustrate, in concrete terms, the **psychic conflicts, attachment issues, and identity crises** that may arise among adopted children and their families.

3. Comprehensive Perspective:

The manuscript effectively combines **legal (kafala), social, and psychopathological** analyses, giving readers a complete picture of the complexity of adoption in the Moroccan and francophone contexts.

4. Theoretical Grounding:

The references and theoretical discussions are well-supported by both **French and international sources**, demonstrating strong research grounding and cross-cultural understanding.

Weaknesses / Suggestions for Minor Revision

1. Language & Style:

- The paper is written in clear French, but could benefit from **minor stylistic and grammatical polishing** to enhance fluidity and professional tone (e.g., harmonize tenses, refine transitions between sections).
- Some sentences are very long; breaking them up would improve readability.

2. Structure & Flow:

- The subheadings ("Aspect juridique," "Aspect social," "Psychopathologie des parents adoptifs," etc.) are appropriate, but should be **numbered consistently** (e.g., 1.1, 1.2, 2.1) for clarity.
- Add a brief **introduction paragraph** before "L'aspect juridique" summarizing the research question, objectives, and methodology (e.g., "Cet article vise à...").

3. Discussion of Vignettes:

- Each vignette includes insightful analysis; however, a **comparative synthesis** after the three cases would strengthen the discussion—highlighting **common**

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

psychopathological patterns (e.g., attachment insecurity, parental idealization, identity struggles).

4. References:

- Ensure **uniform citation formatting** (APA or Vancouver style) and correct minor inconsistencies in URLs and capitalization.
- Some references (e.g., PubMed, Cairn links) could include full retrieval dates or DOIs for consistency.

5. Conclusion:

- The conclusion is strong but could more explicitly tie back to **clinical implications and preventive recommendations** (e.g., early psychotherapeutic support, parental counseling, timing of disclosure).

Overall Evaluation

This is a **clinically rich, original, and contextually grounded** manuscript that contributes valuable insight into the **psychopathology of adoption** within a Moroccan socio-legal and cultural framework. The integration of real clinical cases gives the paper emotional and diagnostic depth, while the theoretical discussions demonstrate academic rigor.

With **minor stylistic and structural revisions**, the paper will meet publication standards and serve as an important reference for mental health professionals, social workers, and policymakers engaged with adoption and child protection issues.