ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-54891

Title: Diagnosis and characterization of the bacterial flora of mango (Mangifera indica L.) in western Senegal

Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision .....

Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	•			
Techn. Quality	•			
Clarity		•		
Significance	•			

Reviewer Name: Adetomiwa Emmanuel Adesokan

Detailed Reviewer's Report

The article shows a baseline research on the bacterial flora of the symptomatic mango tissues of Niayes production region in Senegal. Morphological, biochemical, and molecular reagents used to profile bacterial isolates make part of the current endeavors in the prevention of emerging bacterial challenges, particularly Mango Bacterial Black Spot. The subject matter is aligned to plant health monitoring and has an importance to the production and export chain of mangoes.

Strengths

1. The study addresses a major knowledge gap in Senegal, as bacterial diseases of mango remain poorly documented compared to fungal and pest issues.

2. Both API biochemical tests together with 16S rDNA sequencing enhance the validity of species identification and result interpretation.
3. Tables and figures are also understandable and informative so that a reader can follow the data and laboratory procedures easily.
4. Findings are linked to the discussion with reports of the plant diseases in the region, and the emerging phytopathological threats are underlined.

Weaknesses

1. There are a number of typographical and grammatical mistakes to influence clarity (space, use of articles, subject verbs agreement).
2. The information about the choice of trees and ages of orchards might be explained to understand the variability in the distribution of isolates.
3. The manuscript also includes observed disease symptoms though not explained further on disease specificity of the symptoms as well as differentiating the disease symptoms and fungal infection.

Suggestions for Improvement

1. The quality and flow of the English language need to be improved (editing pass recommended).
2. Add a short statement on the limitations of 16S rDNA for distinguishing closely related species and the need for pathogenicity assays.
3. Further discussion on why Xanthomonas citri pv. mangiferaeindicae was not identified even though it was found in the region, and suggest specific tools (e.g., species-specific PCR).
1. Enhance the introduction's context by highlighting the economic threat of bacterial diseases to mango export markets.

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928
International Journal of Advanced Research
Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP
www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Overall, the manuscript contains useful diagnostic data and is very applicable to the mango disease surveillance. It will be appropriate to be published with minor modifications to its clarity and scientific profundity.