

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: **IJAR-54893**

Date: 20/11/2025

Title: Development of a Bima Folklore-Based Comic to Strengthen Cooperation and Independence Character Traits of Fifth Grade Elementary Students

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

✓Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality			✓	
Clarity			✓	
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: **Dr. Touseef Malik**

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

The manuscript is a well-structured R&D study that develops and validates a folklore-based instructional comic ("La Golo") aimed at strengthening cooperation and independence among fifth-grade students. The paper demonstrates strong methodological detailing, clear ADDIE-based development stages, and presents substantial empirical evidence on validity, practicality, and effectiveness. However, certain sections are lengthy and require refinement for coherence and academic precision.

Recommendation: Accept after minor revision

Detailed Reviewer's Report

STRENGTHS

1. Provides a thorough and systematic application of the **ADDIE R&D model**, with clearly described stages, Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation, supported with detailed explanations and visuals (Figures on pages 5–7).
2. Presents **strong empirical validation**, including media, content, and language expert assessments resulting in an overall validity of 93.9% (Table 1, p.7), demonstrating robust instructional design quality.
3. Shows **high practicality** based on teacher and student responses (96.7% and 98.2%) with evidence taken directly from Tables 1 & 2 (p.8), confirming usability and acceptance in real classroom settings.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

4. Demonstrates **significant effectiveness** through N-Gain and paired-sample t-tests for cooperative (0.65) and independent character (0.62), supported by clear statistical reporting in Tables 3–6 (pp.8–10).
5. Integrates **local cultural wisdom from Bima folklore**, enhancing contextual relevance and increasing engagement, supported through authentic illustrations and storyline elements visible in the development figures (pp.5–7).

WEAKNESSES

1. Several sections, especially the Introduction and Literature Review (pp.1–4), are overly extended and contain overlapping explanations that reduce conciseness and academic clarity.
2. The methodology section lacks a **clear justification** for using purposive sampling and needs a more explicit description of instrument development and scoring procedures.
3. Some statistical results (normality, homogeneity, t-test details) need **more concise presentation** to avoid heavy narrative repetition, particularly between cooperative and independent character sections.
4. Minor language inconsistencies appear throughout the manuscript, such as long sentences, redundancy, and inconsistent paragraph transitions, which need careful editing.
5. Figures are referenced (Figures 1–4) but lack **descriptive captions and numbering consistency**, which should be improved for better readability and standard formatting.