

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55259

Title: Genetic variability for yield and its contributing traits in Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea* L.)

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			x	
Techn. Quality				x
Clarity			x	
Significance				x

Reviewer Name: Dr. Hari Prashad Joshi

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This study evaluates genetic variability in Indian mustard for yield-related traits, employing standard biometrical analyses. While the topic is relevant to breeding programs, the manuscript in its current form is not suitable for publication due to several critical shortcomings. The work lacks novelty, as it primarily confirms widely reported findings on high heritability and genetic advance for yield components in mustard, without offering new insights or germplasm. Methodologically, the description is insufficient; key details such as the specific trial location, year, and precise statistical models are omitted, compromising reproducibility. The presentation is problematic: tables are poorly formatted (e.g., split across pages, inconsistent headings), and Table 1's correlation data is mislabeled and incomplete. Furthermore, the writing requires substantial improvement; the introduction and discussion are repetitive, citations are awkwardly placed in the results, and the references include outdated sources while overlooking key recent literature. The high residual effect (0.29) in the path analysis also suggests important unmeasured factors. Overall, the study does not meet the threshold for original contribution or methodological rigor expected for publication. Major revision would be required to address these fundamental issues.