

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55305

**Title:** CARACTERISATION TECHNIQUE ET SOCIO-ECONOMIQUE DU SYSTEME DE CULTURE A BASE DE LÂ'OIGNON (*ALLIUM cepa* L.) DANS LE DEPARTEMENT DE MADAROUNFA, NIGER

### Recommendation:

Accept as it is .....

Accept after minor revision.....

**Accept after major revision .....**

Do not accept (*Reasons below*) .....

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		x		
Techn. Quality		x		
Clarity				x
Significance			x	

Reviewer Name: Dr. Hari Prashad Joshi

## Detailed Reviewer's Report

### Major Revisions Required:

This manuscript presents a detailed technical and socioeconomic characterization of onion-based cropping systems in the Madarounfa department of Niger, a region of significant agricultural importance. The study is highly relevant, addressing critical issues of farmer profitability, food security, and production constraints within a key value chain for Niger. The methodology, based on a survey of 100 producers and farm budget analysis, is appropriate for the objectives. The data is generally well-presented, with clear tables showing profitability metrics across different cropping systems, and the discussion effectively contextualizes the findings within the broader regional literature.

However, the manuscript requires major revision to meet publication standards. The primary concern is the inconsistent and often unclear presentation of key data, which undermines the reproducibility and robustness of the economic analysis. For instance, the values for average yield per hectare in the text (lines 169-171) do not align with the subsequent calculations of revenue in Table 4, creating confusion about the foundational data. Furthermore, critical methodological details are omitted: the sampling strategy is mentioned as non-probabilistic (quota and snowball), but the specific quotas and selection criteria for the 70/30 split between the two communes are not justified, potentially introducing selection bias that is not addressed.

The structure and language also need refinement. The manuscript frequently shifts between French and English, notably in the abstract and keywords versus the main text. Several sections, such as the list of phytosanitary products, are overly detailed and could be summarized or moved to an appendix. The discussion, while comprehensive, is largely descriptive and would benefit from a more critical synthesis that explicitly highlights how this study's findings confirm, contradict, or add nuance to the existing body of work cited. Finally, the conclusion is somewhat repetitive and should be strengthened to clearly articulate the study's novel contributions and provide more specific, actionable recommendations for policymakers and development actors.

# International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

*www.journalijar.com*

---

## REVIEWER'S REPORT

In summary, the research addresses a valuable topic and contains useful findings, but significant revisions are necessary to clarify the methodology, ensure internal consistency in the data, improve the narrative flow, and elevate the analytical depth of the discussion.