

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55305

Title: CARACTERISATION TECHNIQUE ET SOCIO-ECONOMIQUE DU SYSTEME DE CULTURE A BASE DE LÂ'OIGNON (ALLIUM cepa L.) DANS LE DEPARTEMENT DE MADAROUNFA, NIGER

Recommendation:

Accept as it is ...

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		Good		
Techn. Quality		Good		
Clarity		Good		
Significance		Good		

Dr Thirunahari Ugandhar

Reviewer Name:

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Overall Recommendation

Accept with minor revisions

1. General Evaluation

The manuscript presents a **well-structured and comprehensive technical and socio-economic characterization** of onion-based cropping systems in Madarounfa, Niger. The topic is **highly relevant** given the importance of onion production for livelihoods, food security, and export earnings in Niger and West Africa. The study combines **field survey data with economic analysis**, providing useful evidence for producers, policymakers, and development partners.

2. Scientific Quality and Methodology

- The **objectives are clearly stated** and well aligned with the methodology.
- The **sample size (100 producers)** is adequate and justified.
- Data collection using **KoboCollect** ensures reliability and traceability.
- The use of **descriptive statistics and farm budget analysis** (gross margin, net margin, TRI) is appropriate and consistent with similar studies.
- The results are **logically presented** and supported by relevant literature.

The methodology is scientifically sound and reproducible.

3. Results and Discussion

- The identification of **three onion-based cropping systems** is clear and well-explained.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Profitability analysis is robust and demonstrates **positive net margins**, reinforcing the economic relevance of onion production.
- The discussion is **well contextualised**, with strong comparisons to studies from Niger and other countries.
- The link between onion production and **household food security (4 months coverage)** is an important contribution.

Suggestion: The discussion could be slightly strengthened by explicitly highlighting the **trade-off between higher profitability (pure onion) and risk diversification (associated cropping systems)**.

4. Socio-Economic and Policy Relevance

- The manuscript provides **valuable insights for decision-makers**, particularly on:
Input access and quality
Equipment and irrigation constraints
Need for training and extension services
- Findings are directly applicable to **agricultural development programs and value-chain interventions**.

5. Language and Presentation

- The manuscript is **generally clear and readable**.
- Minor issues observed: Typographical errors (spacing, accents, duplicated words)

Inconsistent formatting of percentages, units, and CFA values. Occasional grammatical lapses

Recommendation:

A **light language and formatting revision** will further improve clarity and professionalism.

6. Ethical and Competing Interests

- No ethical concerns identified.
- The study involves **farmer surveys without sensitive data**.
- No apparent competing interests.

8. Specific Suggestions for Improvement

1. Clarify whether **family labor opportunity costs** could significantly alter profitability estimates.
2. Improve consistency in **tables and figures numbering and titles**.
3. Slightly shorten repetitive sections in the discussion for conciseness.

Final Decision

The manuscript is suitable for publication after minor revisions, primarily related to language polishing and presentation consistency.