

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55716

Title: Global Citizenship Education in Practice: Teachers' Philosophical Commitments and Classroom Enactment in Secondary Schools.

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	✓			
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity	✓			
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Abdul Hameed Shah

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

The manuscript presents a rigorous and well-structured empirical investigation into Global Citizenship Education (GCE), focusing on the relationship between teachers' philosophical commitments and their classroom enactment of GCE practices in secondary schools in Punjab, Pakistan. The study addresses a **significant gap in the literature**, particularly within Global South contexts, and makes a **substantial theoretical, methodological, and policy-relevant contribution** to GCE scholarship.

Strengths

1. Strong theoretical grounding:

The integration of the Theory of Planned Behaviour and the values–belief–action framework provides a robust conceptual basis for examining belief–practice relationships in education.

2. Clear research focus and hypotheses:

The research questions and hypotheses are well-articulated, logically derived from theory, and consistently addressed throughout the manuscript.

3. Methodological rigor:

- The sampling strategy, sample size (N = 450), and statistical analyses are appropriate and clearly justified.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- Reliability and validity procedures are adequately reported, enhancing the credibility of the findings.
- Ethical considerations and transparency practices align with international research standards (e.g., STROBE).

4. Empirical contribution:

The findings empirically demonstrate a belief–practice gap in GCE and confirm philosophical commitment as a significant predictor of classroom enactment, contributing valuable quantitative evidence to a field dominated by qualitative studies.

5. Policy and practical relevance:

The study offers important implications for teacher education, school leadership, and policy implementation related to SDG 4.7 and UNESCO's GCE agenda.

Areas Requiring Minor Revision

1. Manuscript length and conciseness:

- Some sections of the literature review and methodology are very detailed and could be slightly condensed to improve readability without sacrificing rigor.

2. Clarity of results presentation:

- Tables and figures (e.g., Table 1 and the conceptual framework) should be clearly referenced and fully presented in the text for ease of interpretation.
- A brief summary paragraph at the end of the Results section would help highlight key findings.

3. Discussion enhancement:

- The Discussion section (not fully visible in the provided text) should explicitly link findings back to the theoretical frameworks and prior international studies.
- More explicit discussion of contextual constraints in public versus private schools would further strengthen the interpretation of institutional effects.

4. Limitations and future research:

- Although limitations are acknowledged, they could be more clearly consolidated into a dedicated subsection to improve transparency.
- Future research directions, particularly longitudinal and observational studies, should be emphasized.

5. Minor language refinements:

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- The manuscript is generally well-written; however, minor stylistic and grammatical refinements would further enhance clarity and flow.

Conclusion of the Reviewer

This manuscript represents a **high-quality and original contribution** to the field of Global Citizenship Education. It is theoretically informed, methodologically sound, and empirically robust, offering valuable insights into how teachers' philosophical commitments translate into classroom practice under institutional constraints. Only **minor revisions** are required to enhance clarity, conciseness, and presentation.