

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55837

Title: Evaluating the Socio-Economic Impact of Horticulture in Jammu and Kashmir

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality			x	
Techn. Quality				x
Clarity			x	
Significance			x	

Reviewer Name: Dr. Hari Prashad Joshi

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This paper provides a timely and comprehensive analysis of the socio-economic role of horticulture in Jammu & Kashmir, a topic of significant regional importance. The review is well-structured, draws upon recent and relevant data, and successfully highlights the sector's substantial contributions to GDP, employment, and rural livelihoods. The identification of policy gaps, particularly the critical underfunding relative to economic contribution, is a major strength. However, major revisions are required before the manuscript can be accepted for publication. The primary concern is the lack of a clearly defined methodology. The paper is presented as a review but makes specific analytical claims (e.g., employment multipliers, income comparisons) without describing the methods for data synthesis, source selection criteria, or analytical framework. This omission undermines the reproducibility and scholarly rigor of the work. Furthermore, while data is cited, much of the analysis remains descriptive. A deeper, more critical engagement with the cited statistics is needed for instance, interrogating the sources of employment estimates or the distributional aspects of income gains.

The theoretical integration is also underdeveloped. References to concepts like value chains and high-value agriculture are made but not systematically used to structure the analysis or interpret findings. The recommendations section, though useful, would be stronger if explicitly tied back to the specific constraints identified in the analysis, creating a more cohesive argument. Finally, the manuscript requires thorough proofreading for minor grammatical errors and consistency in formatting (e.g., currency symbols, citation presentation). Addressing these issues will elevate the paper from a valuable descriptive overview to a robust, analytically sound contribution.