

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-55839

Title: Agroecological adaptability and forage valorization of Pennisetum purpureum and Dolichos lablab for small ruminant feeding systems in southern Niger: a narrative review

Recommendation:

Accept as it is

Accept after minor revision.....

Accept after major revision

Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		x		
Techn. Quality		x		
Clarity			x	
Significance			x	

Reviewer Name: Dr. Hari Prashad Joshi

Detailed Reviewer's Report

This narrative review provides a valuable and well-structured synthesis on a topic of practical significance for sustainable livestock systems in the Sahel. The agroecological framing is appropriate, and the review effectively highlights the complementary roles of Pennisetum purpureum and Dolichos lablab. The methodology is clearly described, enhancing transparency.

However, major revisions are required. The central weakness is the lack of a critical, analytical edge. The review predominantly describes and aggregates findings without sufficiently evaluating the strength, context, or potential biases of the evidence. For instance, claims about biomass yields or protein content should be critically appraised in relation to the specific agro-climatic conditions and management practices of the source studies. The discussion would be significantly strengthened by a dedicated section analyzing key knowledge gaps and contradictions in the literature, rather than briefly mentioning limitations. Furthermore, while the conclusion states the strategy is "coherent," the review undersells the socio-economic adoption barriers hinted at in the limitations. A deeper integration of this socio-technical perspective is needed to translate agronomic potential into practical relevance for smallholders. Addressing these points will elevate the manuscript from a competent summary to a more impactful critical review.