

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56033

Title: EFFECTIVENESS OF SHODHANA AND SHAMANA THERAPIES IN UDAR VIKAR: INSIGHTS FROM A CASE STUDY

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
 ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
 Accept after major revision
 Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Date: 02.02.26

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the Study:

- The manuscript addresses a relevant and under-explored area of integrating Ayurvedic therapies into the management of abdominal disorders, specifically Udar Vikar.
- It presents a detailed case report with comprehensive clinical, diagnostic, and therapeutic documentation.
- The inclusion of ultrasound imaging pre- and post-treatment provides objective evidence supporting the clinical outcomes.
- The treatment plan is well-described, combining traditional Ayurvedic interventions with supportive dietary and lifestyle modifications.
- The discussion links classical Ayurvedic concepts with modern clinical findings, promoting an integrative perspective.

Weaknesses of the Study:

- As a single-case report, the findings have limited generalizability.
- The absence of control or comparison groups limits the ability to attribute improvements solely to the Ayurvedic interventions.
- No detailed statistical analysis or standardized outcome measures are provided, reducing the robustness of the conclusions.
- The manuscript lacks explicit mention of ethical clearance, institutional review board approval, or informed consent, which is essential, especially for publishing case reports involving diagnostic and therapeutic procedures.
- The language and grammar could benefit from revision for clarity and professionalism.
- Some sections, especially tables, are dense and may benefit from clearer formatting for ease of reading.
- The references are somewhat outdated and limited; inclusion of more recent studies could strengthen the literature review.

Reviewer Comments:

- **Title and Abstract:** The title effectively conveys the focus but could be slightly more specific (e.g., indicating the scope of the case or outcomes). The abstract summarizes the case well; however, it would benefit from clearer delineation of methodology and quantification of improvements, along with mention of ultrasound findings as objective evidence.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Introduction and Objectives:** The introduction provides a comprehensive background on Udar Vikar from Ayurvedic and modern perspectives. The objective is clear; however, framing it as an exploratory case report rather than hypothesis-driven research would clarify the scope.
- **Methodology and Analysis:** Details of the Ayurvedic diagnosis, treatment protocol, and follow-up are provided, but the methodology lacks standardization and does not include specific outcome measures or validated scales. No statistical analysis or assessment of significance is reported, which is acceptable in a case report but limits scientific rigor.
- **Results and Discussion:** Results are descriptive and show symptom resolution and ultrasound improvements. The discussion appropriately connects clinical outcomes with Ayurvedic concepts but could cite more current literature and comparative studies. The causal relationship between treatment and outcomes remains associative.
- **Conclusion and Implications:** The conclusion summarizes the symptomatic improvements and potential of Ayurvedic therapies but should explicitly acknowledge the limitations of single-case evidence and recommend further research.
- **Ethical Clearance:** The manuscript does not explicitly mention ethical approval or informed consent for the case report, which is a critical oversight that needs addressing before publication.
- **Language and Presentation:** Overall language is understandable but contains grammatical errors and awkward phrasing that require editing. Consistent formatting of tables and figures will improve readability.
- **References:** The references include classical texts and recent studies, but updating with newer peer-reviewed articles on similar interventions or clinical trials would strengthen the manuscript.

Additional Note: A thorough check for prior online publication or redundancy indicates that this specific case report has not been published elsewhere, based on available data. Nevertheless, a standard disclosure confirming originality should be included before publication.