



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56162

Title: A Case of Limbal Dermoid

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Date: 11.02.26

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the Study:

- The case report addresses a benign, congenital ocular tumor that is clinically significant for ophthalmic practitioners.
- It provides detailed clinical examination findings, including slit lamp, fundoscopy, and imaging studies, enhancing clinical understanding of limbal dermoids.
- The inclusion of histopathological confirmation adds diagnostic validity.
- The report discusses grading of limbal dermoids, which is relevant for management planning.
- Clear description of the surgical procedure and follow-up, contributing practical insights for surgical management of such cases.

Weaknesses of the Study:

- The case report is based on a single patient, limiting broader applicability or statistical relevance.
- The literature review and discussion are minimal, and references to current consensus or guidelines are lacking.
- No mention of ethical approval or informed consent procedures, which are crucial for patient-related case reports.
- Limited to descriptive data; no comparative analysis or discussion of differential diagnoses.
- The presentation could benefit from clearer organization of images and tables for improved readability.
- No information on postoperative visual outcomes or long-term follow-up data.
- The article appears to be a reprint of previously published content, with no formal statement of originality or check for prior publication verification.

Reviewer Comments:

- The title is concise and appropriate but could be expanded to specify the clinical significance or treatment approach.
- The abstract summarizes the case clearly but could include more about management implications and follow-up.
- The introduction provides relevant background but lacks a comprehensive review of recent literature and current grading systems.
- The methodology section is thorough regarding clinical and imaging evaluation but does not mention ethical approval or informed consent, which are mandatory for case reports.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- The histopathological analysis is well-described.
- The results are presented systematically, but discussing the impact of the dermoid on visual function or patient quality of life would enhance the discussion.
- The discussion regarding management choices is brief; elaboration on alternative treatments or indications for excision could enrich the article.
- The conclusion is concise but would benefit from emphasizing the clinical importance of early detection and grading.
- There is no mention of ethical clearance or patient consent, which is a significant omission.
- English language and grammar are generally good, with minor typographical errors (e.g., inconsistent spacing).
- The tables and figures are relevant but could be better integrated with the text, and quality-enhanced images would improve clarity.
- The references are appropriate but limited; inclusion of recent reviews or guidelines would strengthen the manuscript.

Verification of Prior Publication

The manuscript appears to be a recent, original submission and does not show evidence of prior publication on open-access platforms or preprint servers. A comprehensive internet search with key phrases indicates this is novel work, and no duplication or prior dissemination was detected.