



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56176

Title: *CAUGHT IN TRANSIT: HEPATOPULMONARY HYDATID DISEASE CROSSING ANATOMICAL BOUNDARIES – A CASE REPORT*

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity			✓	
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Date: 13.02.26

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the study:

- **Originality and Novelty:** The manuscript presents a rare case of hepatopulmonary hydatid disease with simultaneous liver and lung involvement, complicated by cyst rupture. While hydatid disease is well-documented, this specific presentation with crossing anatomical boundaries and rupture is relatively uncommon and adds valuable clinical insight. The detailed imaging findings and the multidisciplinary approach employed further contribute to the originality of the report.
- **Relevance:** This case is highly relevant to clinicians involved in infectious diseases, pulmonology, hepatology, and surgical management, especially in endemic regions. It emphasizes early detection, imaging, and combined surgical and medical therapy, which are pertinent in practice.
- **Methodology and Data Quality:** The case description is thorough, covering clinical presentation, laboratory investigations, multiple imaging modalities (CXR, CECT, MRI), and surgical management. The data appears comprehensive and well-documented. However, the report does not specify ethical approval or informed consent details, which are essential for case reports involving patient data.
- **Contribution to the Field:** This report underscores the importance of a multidisciplinary approach, highlights key radiological signs (such as the serpentine sign in ruptured cysts), and demonstrates effective management strategies. It reinforces the utility of imaging in diagnosis, staging, and follow-up.

Weaknesses of the Study

- The report lacks explicit information on ethical approval or informed consent, which is crucial for case reports.
- The discussion could benefit from referencing more recent or comprehensive literature for context.
- Limited detail on the patient's follow-up period and long-term prognosis.
- The literature review is somewhat superficial; a deeper discussion of similar cases would improve contextual understanding.
- No mention of specific statistical or analytical methods, but this is typical for case reports.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Reviewer Comments

- **Title and Abstract:** The title is concise and accurately reflects the content. The abstract effectively summarizes the case, though it could improve clarity by explicitly stating the rarity of the presentation and emphasizing key imaging features.
- **Introduction and Objectives:** The introduction provides a succinct overview of hydatid disease, its typical presentation, and the rarity of hepatopulmonary involvement. Clear objective setting is lacking and should be explicitly stated to guide the reader.
- **Methodology and Statistical Analysis:** Given this is a case report, formal statistical analysis is not required. However, a structured description of diagnostic procedures, treatment protocols, and follow-up would enhance clarity.
- **Results and Discussion:** Findings are well-presented with appropriate imaging descriptions. The discussion covers key aspects but should include more comparison with similar cases or literature to strengthen clinical relevance. Clarify whether any novel therapeutic approaches or insights were utilized.
- **Conclusion and Implications:** The conclusion appropriately emphasizes early recognition and a multidisciplinary approach. It would benefit from explicitly highlighting the potential for life-threatening complications and the importance of awareness in endemic areas.
- **Ethical Clearance:** The manuscript does not mention ethical approval or informed consent. For case reports, explicit statement on obtaining patient consent and approval from an ethics committee is necessary.
- **Language and Presentation:** Overall, the language is clear, with minor typographical issues. Some sentences are lengthy and could be simplified for readability. The formatting of references is conventional, but consistency should be checked.
- **Figures and Tables:** The imaging descriptions are detailed; however, actual figures are missing from this file. Inclusion of clear, high-quality images would significantly enhance understanding and educational value.
- **References:** References are appropriate and recent but should follow a uniform citation style. Including more recent literature on hepatopulmonary hydatid disease would be beneficial.

Verification of Prior Publication

The manuscript appears to be a recent, original submission and does not show evidence of prior publication on open-access platforms or preprint servers. A comprehensive internet search with key phrases indicates this is novel work, and no duplication or prior dissemination was detected.