



ISSN NO. 2320-5407

ISSN(O): 2320-5407 | ISSN(P): 3107-4928

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-56253

Title: The Kidney's False Alarm: When a Suspected Renal Colic Reveals a Hidden Aortic Threat

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- ✓ Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance	✓			

Reviewer Name: Dr S. K. Nath

Date: 17.02.26

Detailed Reviewer's Report

Strengths of the Study

- **Originality and Relevance:** The case highlights an unusual presentation of intramural aortic hematoma mimicking renal colic, emphasizing the importance of differential diagnosis in acute abdominal pain—this is clinically significant.
- **Comprehensive Diagnostic Approach:** The use of multimodal imaging—including contrast-enhanced CT, PET scan, and echocardiography—demonstrates a thorough and multidisciplinary diagnostic process.
- **Clear Illustration of Diagnostic Strategy:** The case provides a valuable example of combining anatomical and functional imaging to differentiate IAH from inflammatory aortitis.
- **Contribution to Clinical Practice:** Reinforces the need for vigilance and detailed assessment in atypical presentations and the potential for conservative management in selected cases.
- **Well-structured and detailed case description:** The manuscript thoroughly describes the patient's presentation, investigations, and management, fostering educational value.

Weaknesses of the Study

- **Single Case Limitation:** As a case report, its findings have limited generalizability, which is inherent but should be acknowledged explicitly.
- **Lack of Long-term Follow-up Data:** The report mentions the necessity of follow-up but does not provide longitudinal outcomes for the patient.
- **Absence of detailed discussion regarding criteria for conservative management:** A more explicit outline of the decision-making process leading to conservative therapy would strengthen clinical applicability.
- **Limited references to recent literature:** While some references are up-to-date, inclusion of the latest guidelines or studies on IAH management could enhance context.
- **Minor language and presentation issues:** Some grammatical errors and awkward phrasing are present, which may hinder clarity.

Reviewer Comments

- **Title and Abstract:** The title accurately reflects the case's focus. The abstract summarizes the key points but could be more concise and explicitly state the novelty of the presentation.
- **Introduction and Objectives:** Well-written, providing adequate background on IAH. Clearly defines the clinical challenge in differentiating IAH from other causes of acute pain.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- **Methodology and Analysis:** The diagnostic approach is appropriate for a case report; however, a brief rationale for choosing each modality, especially PET scan, could be expanded. Statistical analysis is not applicable in a single case report, but the discussion contextualizes findings well.
- **Results and Discussion:** Results are clearly presented, but more emphasis on the implications of the imaging findings and decision-making process would enhance understanding. The discussion is comprehensive but could better compare findings with recent studies.
- **Conclusion and Implications:** Conclusion is balanced, emphasizing individualized management. Including explicit recommendations for clinicians encountering similar cases would benefit readers.
- **Ethical considerations:** The manuscript does not mention obtaining Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval or patient consent, which is necessary for case reports involving patient data.
- **Language and Formatting:** The manuscript has several grammatical errors and awkward sentence structures. Minor typographical issues are present, and figure descriptions could be more detailed.
- **References:** Appropriately selected, mostly recent and relevant. Ensuring consistency in citation format would improve professionalism.

Note: A thorough review of the manuscript content and an initial search indicates that this specific case report has not been previously published online or in any other outlet. It appears to be an original publication, contributing new insights into the diagnostic challenge of intramural aortic hematoma presenting with mimicry of urological conditions.