



Journal Homepage: -www.journalijar.com

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF ADVANCED RESEARCH (IJAR)

Article DOI:10.21474/IJAR01/16760
DOI URL: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21474/IJAR01/16760>



RESEARCH ARTICLE

ORIENTALISM IN THE CONSTRUCTION OF A SELF-OTHER IDENTITY IN VILLENEUVE'S DUNE 2021

TimijaFuto and Elnaz Nasehi

Manuscript Info

Manuscript History

Received: 28 February 2023

Final Accepted: 31 March 2023

Published: April 2023

Key words:-

Orientalism, Dune, Denis Villeneuve,
Language, World-Building, Messiah,
White Saviour, Identity, Self-Other,
Environment

Abstract

The discourse about Orientalism, first mentioned by Edward Said has as long history and changed over time by drawing from discourses in different fields. In this paper, Denis Villeneuve's cinematic adaptation of Dune in 2021 was analysed through the lens of Orientalism and through the lens of identity in construction of the self and the other. Firstly, main orientalist themes in Dune that were identified before by other scholars have been discussed. Secondly, the relationship between self and other was explored by drawing from literature about identity in culture and memory and relating it to scenes in the film. It can be observed that the discourse mentioned in the first half of the paper focuses on binary ideas of the Orient and Occident. The second half of the paper proposes a complex and interwoven view of self and other that stand in relationship as rather dynamic and changing complements than as binaries only, and are made visible through the young hero's journey.

Copy Right, IJAR, 2023. All rights reserved.

Introduction:-

This paper is a discussion of Denis Villeneuve's movie Dune 2021 through the lens of Orientalism. The movie is based on the science fiction (hereafter SF) novel of Frank Herbert (1920 - 1986) which was published in 1965 – the first out of six books in this series. When it comes to Orientalism in Dune, there is already a body of literature that discusses orientalist themes based on the current as well as previous cinematic adaptation(s), the book(s) or both. Thus, the first part of this paper will comprise a short summary of the movie plot and a review of the main orientalist themes that are apparent in the current film adaptation and that were discussed by several scholars in this field. The other part will then focus on the construction of a self-other relationship in terms of identity by drawing from related literature. Identity will be discussed in terms of representations of the East and the West that can be seen in the film drawing from literature about identity in culture and memory as well as environment and identity, individual and collective identity. Short examples from the film adaptation will illustrate the findings.

The plot summary

Dune is a planet in the Padishah Empire that is also referred to as Arrakis. Its native people, the Fremen who are nomads, live in the desert of Dune and in colonies of the imperial powers. Spice is the resource extracted from Dune. It is inevitable for space travel and has geriatric functions while it also serves as hallucinogenic for some individuals who develop visions. It is a product of the worms who dwell in the desert, and it is sacred to the Fremen. After setting the scene on the planet with an introduction from the perspective of the Fremen, we see the transaction of power over Dune and the Spice, ordered by the Padishah emperor – who receives support by (noble) feudal families (also referred to as houses) – to house Atreides. The story revolves around the main character Paul

Atreides who is seen as the Mahdi, the messiah by the Fremen as well as his mother Jessica who, by their enemies is referred to as the Concubine of Duke Leto Atreides who loves her sincerely. Although the Duke wants to harness the desert power of the Fremen by building an alliance, he is facing several obstacles: an attack on Paul's life and a sabotaged spice harvester – to name two. Eventually the colony falls back to the hands of the Harkonnens who planned the downfall of house Atreides. Paul and Jessica flee to the desert, where Paul develops his vision through the contact with spice. They eventually reach a group of Fremen and join them, after Paul kills one Fremen during a battle to get accepted as a member (Villeneuve, 2021).

Theoretical Background and Orientalism in Dune

Frank Jacob (2022) writes: “While anti-colonial in nature, the signs presented [in Dune] are very often related to an orientalist semiotic system, which was not fully decolonialized in 1965, and, considering the new film, not in 2021 either” (p. 74). What are the triggers and cues, that relate the movie to an orientalist discourse? Although written in the 1960s, Dune's themes are still relevant today. Janet Kafka (1975) as Frank Jacob noticed, points out three major themes which are present in SF narratives, and which make it attractive to contemporary audiences. Dune uses all three themes while also wrapping them into Orientalist motifs: First, “the use and abuse of political power” which can be observed in the relationship between feudal families as colonial powers and Fremen, as well as between the Bene Gesserit's missionary work and the Fremen. Second, “the importance of maintaining a whole planet's ecological balance” which is one of the main themes of Arrakis (Dune) as desert planet in which water is a scarce resource and in which spice is the commodity of the empire. Third, “the spiritual development (based on the consciousness of the functioning of mind and body) of the young hero” (p. 51), which can be observed in Paul's transformation not only into a man but also into a messianic figure, the coming of a (white) saviour.

The motifs and imagery in Dune draw from an orientalist discourse which was first identified and discussed by Edward Said (1935-2003). His theory refers to Foucault's (1926-1984) theory about discourse (1981) which critically explores how discourse is constructed and established within academia. In Said's case the discourse describes the body of knowledge that is created about a geographic place that is “the Orient” and the people in those areas – “the Orientals”. Thus, academics and artists draw and co-create this discourse which becomes a sort of entity – a lens through which (mainly the West) can look at the East to separate itself from it and to construct its own identity through this process. At the same time the West envelops what it creates as the East. The discourse penetrates real lives by constructing a certain reality that was advantageous for colonial powers who could then justify their colonial activities towards native peoples (Said, 2003, pp. 1-28).

Orientalism in Cinema

Film theory draws upon interdisciplinary fields to interpret and analyse Orientalism in cinema, such as “feminist analysis, genre criticism, psychoanalytic interpretation and political history” (Bernstein & Studlar, 1997, p. 5).

Maryam Khalid notices, since Orientalism is a Foucauldian discourse, it is applicable to many fields. It has a “repository of representations”, and the discourse is ever shifting, fluid and “constantly being added to by the changing dominant (but multifaceted) discourses of the West” (Khalid, 2011, p. 17). It becomes a perpetuation of stereotypes, a term that Walter Lipmann (1889-1974) coined in 1922 and which he understands as “a problem of the acquisition of meaning” that occurs through the “forming of habits” via “simple apprehension”. It offers “definiteness”, “distinction” and “consistency or stability of meaning into what is otherwise vague and wavering” (Lippmann, 1998, p. 81). Jack G. Shaheen cites an article from Mareen Dowd, who discusses stereotypes and notices that in places where “politeness and tiptoeing” is required a “hunger for vulgar stereotypes in popular culture” emerges. They combine offensiveness with comfort and “wrap life in the archetypal toastiness of fairy tale and myth” (Dowd, 2001). Shaheen (2003) analysed 900 Hollywood films and noticed a sustained consistency of orientalist tropes and stereotypes over decades when it comes to the representation of people from the Middle East in Hollywood. Through repetition, the Western audience has been tutored on the constructed and stereotyped identity of Middle Eastern people which the Western audience linked to Arabic people and Islam specifically (p. 171). The trouble with this discourse is that it leaves the audience with (mis-)conceptions and racial tropes and it is “arousing the fear of the other” (p. 175) that in the end affects real people. Shaheen illustrates this well when he talks about the ‘vilification of ethnicities’ that allowed imperial and colonial powers to lynch and enslave people (p. 174) or to wage war in the name of terror towards specific ethnicities and geographical regions (Khalid, 2011). These extreme scenarios in society may spring from media representations where people tend to ingest and learn views and perspectives “across generations” (Shaheen, 2003, p. 176). Hence it is necessary to point out orientalist perspectives

and stereotypes in media, works of art, fiction, and entertainment so that power relations and biases can be identified, understood, and deconstructed.

The Language and Worldbuilding of Dune

One aspect in which we encounter orientalist themes in Dune is language. A tendency in cinema is to use Arabic words and attach completely different meanings to them. Shaheen (2003) demonstrates this with the use of the word “sheikh” which actually means “a wise elderly person” but usually inherits the stereotype of a hook-nosed man capturing “pale-faced blondes for their harems” (p. 180).

Kara Kennedy (2016) discusses the use of language and its orientalist themes in Dune in her paper when she talks about epic world-building as a process including language, character, places, and cultures to make the world believable for the audience. In this regard the author “take[s] on the role of Adam, giving a name to all of the items in their domain” (p. 99). Instead of a whole new language invention like we see it in The Lord of the Rings Trilogy (2001-2003), Dune borrows familiar words from real, natural languages – namely semitic languages like Arabic and Hebrew, but also ancient Greek – and adjusts them to fit them to the desert planet, creating a familiarity for the audience. Thus, the main language is English, but the names of things, places and people are borrowed, making it a “posteriori language” (Wolf, 2012, p. 229). According to Kennedy (2016) ‘Orientalism is established with the juxtaposition of the Middle East with the West. This occurs since some Fremen characters as well as their items and places (specifically the sacred items and animals) – are then associated with Arabic or Arabic sounding names and words to create exotic effects, while House Atreides and the main characters are endowed with Ancient Greek and Christian names’ (p. 100). ‘Paul is not only Saint Paul (p. 101), he also becomes the Mahdi, the Lisan-al-Gaib – the Messiah and the Voice from the outer world’ (p. 104). The Bene Gesserit are resembling benevolent Jesuit (Herbert, 2003, p. 15). The reverent mother Gaius Helen Mohiam may point to Gaius Julius Cesar as well as to Helen, daughter of Zeus and Leda. The name Mohiam seems to refer to Mohism (Defoort, 2014). Arrakis, the name for Dune is reminiscent of Iraq.

Spice Orientalism and Colonialism

Besides language, the ecology in Dune as well as the spice as commodity and its trade is contributing to world-building as Kara Kennedy (2021) explores in her paper. Kennedy refers to Mark J. P. Wolf (2012), who discusses several attributes a successful world building will use: ‘invention, completeness, and consistency’. Invention describes, to what degree known assumptions based on the primary world (real world) have been manipulated regarding technology, geography, history, language, physics, biology, zoology, culture, and custom. To achieve credibility the world must be ‘logically constructed and carefully presented’ (p. 51) and ‘the degree of depth of any invention must be considered by the author’ (p. 54). ‘Completeness is never actually achieved, only suggested. It is thus an illusion that provides the audience with enough information so that various experiences of the character as well as their background and any other explanations are covered’ (p. 57). ‘To achieve consistency everything within the world must be connected through integration of details to create the impression of plausibility and feasibility without contradiction’ (p. 62). In this case the orientalist themes provide the Dune narrative with already constructed and thus familiar views about a Middle Eastern ethnicity and religion that seems exotic and different enough for Western audiences to apply it to the Fremen in particular.

Spice as Kennedy (2021) notices, integrates all three aspects of world-building in various degrees. It is an invention with many analogies to the real world, thus offering consistency and completeness. ‘On the one hand, it is relatable to the precious spice of ancient spice trades for which voyages were undertaken to satisfy medieval tastes’. It was only available (and affordable) for those with high status – the feudal nobles who extracted it as a luxurious commodity from “exotic” countries in the East. ‘The potential of igniting conflict in these times was lurking in form of crusades (holy wars)’. Thus, the earlier mentioned juxtaposition of names and languages of East and West is repeated in the associations with Spice. ‘The reference to oil is very strong as well. As “black gold” extracted from the Middle East from countries like Iraq – sounding like Arrakis and resembling a desert place with an Arabic speaking nomadic people like the Bedouin, who like the Fremen live in an extreme environment’ (pp. 3-6).

A third analogy occurs where Spice relates to psychedelic substances like LSD or psilocybin, which is shown in the movie through Paul who inhales the spice and receives visions of the future. David M. Higgins (2013) points out that these drug experiences are “shaped by unacknowledged imperial metaphors” (Higgins, p. 228). He refers to Susan Zieger (2007), who talks about drug experiences of white male subjects, who ingest hashish or opioids to imaginatively journey to an orientalist imagination of the East, curing the “narrator’s desire for travel” to the East

by intoxication of “racist psychopathology” while he “appears oblivious of the imperial power giving shape to his fancies” (Zieger, p. 1532). Higgins then suggests that narratives like *Dune* have an approach that stresses on the mastery of inner exploration and inner voyages as means to liberate the “racially unmarked male subject from the repressive internal colonization of the psyche” (Higgins, 2013, p. 230). This decolonisation becomes necessary for the privileged white male. Higgins mentions that narratives from that time *Dune* was written “seem to reject biological racism” via skin colour or ethnicity. It is rather that the heroic male characters displays a superiority of consciousness and becomes a race that is evolutionary progressed, which we can also see with Paul Atreides, a trained elite, Mahdi and potential Kwisatz Haderach – the awaited super being of the Bene Gesserit (2013, p. 231).

The Messiah Theme

According to the Oxford Learner’s Dictionary a “Messiah (in Judaism) [is] a king who will be sent by God to save the Jewish people, as promised in the Hebrew Bible” while “(in Christianity) [a Messiah is] Jesus Christ, regarded by Christians as the Messiah of the Hebrew Bible, sent by God into the world to save people from evil and sin” (Oxford Learner’s Dictionary, 2022). There is a pattern towards a tendency in SF narratives in the 1960s which introduces messianic heroes to the audience as Roberts (2006) as well as Broderick (2003) notice. The 1960s were an ambivalent and contractionary time in which people in the West were confronted with technical and educational innovation, the moon landing, flourishing new religions and cults as well as the fear of a Cold War and atomic annihilation which peaked during the Cuban missile crisis (Roberts, 2006, p. 233). It marked a decade in which the general atmosphere suggested that anything was possible and Nietzsche’s (1844-1900) *Übermensch* (Nietzsche, 1999) was just a grasp away (Roberts, 2006; Broderick, 2003).

Dune in general is influenced by Christianity, Islam, and Buddhism as Frank Jacob (2022) noticed. Religion “plays a practical role for the plot development” (pp. 44-45) since both the Bene Gesserit through their missionary work as well as House Atreides through their diplomatic work exploit the religious Fremen. Religion then mainly relates to the Fremen rather than the aristocratic houses (p. 45). Frank Jacob points to Harris Durrani’s article about the Muslimness of *Dune* who suggest that it “goes beyond mere orientalist aesthetics” (Durrani, 2021) and that *Dune* encourages an active dialogue of Muslim ideas, practices, and histories. In cinema however the tendency is to portray Islam as a “violent faith” (Shaheen, 2003, p. 179) something that is only hinted to in this *Dune* adaptation, which avoids the book’s jargon about the jihad, replacing it with crusade – words that both mean holy war, although from different angles.

In her Master Thesis, Sanjana Singh (2012) explores the messiah and martyr themes in the *Dune* chronicles. She points to parallels to Jesus who by word of the bible text must be a man – like the condition, that the Kwisatz Haderach must be male – and who is tested in the desert, emerging from it as messiah. The role of the women, even of the political active Bene Gesserit is very traditional (Singh, 2012, p. 15). Robert points to two religious traditions that each encapsulate their own messianic narrative. The first is Islam, as discussed before, with the Mahdi messiah and the second is the Judaic-Christian divine messiah (Roberts, 2006, p. 235). A messiah is a delegate of change who confronts and destabilises the ruling authority, (Singh, 2012, p. 21) something that is set in motion when Paul and Jessica survive the usurper and flee to the desert. All this was not possible without the work of the Bene Gesserit who, set up the Missionaria Protectiva for the Mahdi, which integrated beliefs, myths, and superstitions into Fremen culture (p. 46). This process, once set into motion could then be harnessed by the Bene Gesserit. In one scene Jessica and Paul enter the Thopter (the Helicopter) and talk about how the Fremen were made to believe in the Mahdi as a result of missionary work.

As Singh points out, the Fremen engage in ritual (p. 46) and symbolic meanings, as can be seen in the film when Stilgar enters the Duke’s hall and spits in front of everyone to show respect. Another scene displays a sacred gesture towards Jessica through the maid Mape who delivers a crysknife – a tooth from the sacred worm. A ritual can also be observed in the end when Paul fights for his life and kills a Fremen with a crysknife and then chooses the name Muad’Dib as initiation into the Fremen tribe.

White Saviour and T. E. Lawrence

Frank Jacob (2022) extensively analysed the parallels to the historical figure T. E. Lawrence (1888-1935) and the biographical movie *Lawrence of Arabia* (Lean, 1962). This is specifically interesting because Frank Herbert according to his son Brian (2003), was familiar with T.E. Lawrence (Herbert, p. 123) and his book *Seven Pillars of Wisdom* (Lawrence, 1991). When it comes to Paul, it can be noticed, that he is a product of the Bene Gesserit breeding

program which is eugenic¹ as Jacob observed through Vibergand which in Dune “problematizes the covert workings of ideology within religious and military institutions, which in turn allows for the rise of leaders and policies which are prone to the abuse of power”. Paul is thus an expression or result of “biopower” of the Bene Gesserit (Viberg, 2019, p. 12), a superhuman as well as a “fetishization of male masculinity”, which the Bene Gesserit seek to control for their purpose (Jacob, 2022, p. 76). There are similarities in both narratives. Paul is challenging the Harkonnens as well as T. E. Lawrence was challenging the Ottoman Empire in the Middle East. Paul instinctively knows how important the desert power is and he can be seen in one of the first scenes of the movie studying Arrakis, the Fremen and their customs. T. E. Lawrence also notices the importance of the Arab people for the interests of the British Empire. The relations and “tension” between Fremen and Harkonnen, as well as Arabs and Ottomans seem similar as Jakob points out (pp. 76-77). Lawrence’s success “stimulated the Western idea that people in the Middle East needed a ‘white savior’ figure to actually achieve something” (p. 80).

Although we see an African American woman playing the role of a white male, namely the ecologist Liet Kynes, the orientalist idea of the white saviour did not disappear, the Middle East is displayed as in need of a philanthropic hero (Mamdani, 2002, p. 766). ‘The choice of using a white male as main character is yet something that persists in cinema’ (Jacob, 2022, p. 84) as can be observed in movies like Avatar (2009), the Last Samurai (2003), Cloud Atlas (2012), District 9 (2009), Django Unchained (2012) and Isle of Dogs (2018) to name a few.

The Self-Other Relationship

So far, the main orientalist themes that are inherent in the movie and identified by other scholars have been discussed. A pattern can be observed which is showing a juxtaposition of complementary themes related to the East and the West. It appears in the use of language and the naming of people, places, and things, as well as through the world-building that relates it to ideas of the East, seen by the West. This juxtaposition is also present in the relationship of the religious Fremen to the secular Houses. The Fremen who live on a desert planet on one hand, and house Atrides who inhabits the planet Caladan, which is reminiscent of rainy Ireland on the other hand. In the before mentioned presentations of Orientalism binaries interpret the Orient as “backward, exotic, despotic and lazy”, while the “West became the pinnacle of civilisation: rational, moral and Christian” (p. 17). Some of these notions especially of a civilised and rational West can be observed in the representation of House Atrides. Duke Leto appears moral in comparison to the vilified and almost barbaric Vladimir Harkonnen, their enemy who plots treason and murder and whose name Vladimir is reminiscent of someone who comes from a Slavic country like Russia. These themes create a tension throughout the film where ideas of the West as the self-perspective and the East as the other-perspective touch or mingle together and which is shown throughout the hero’s journey and in his visions.

Romanticising Western Identity – Paul the Aristocrat

When we talk about the self and the other, we inevitably speak of the construction of identities. As Weissberg (1999) noticed, identity is deeply linked to memory (p. 10) from which it emerges, and which gives a person personhood (p. 8). It comes from the idea of an individual, which emerged in the era of “enlightenment and romantic thought” and constitutes a person whose being is extended over time (through memory of the past) and who reflects upon it and thus creates an imagined continuity of the self (p. 9).

Some of these themes that were discussed before, relate to the ways, in which ideas of the West construct a self, that is projected into the main protagonist’s identity, especially as elite and as saviour. Paul displays qualities, such as being just, understanding, and diplomatic, which are Western ideals of benevolence (Jefferess, 2020). His identity exists in defined boundaries that are familiar for the Western audience and sets it apart from the identity of the Fremen, the Harkonnens and the environment of Dune. Paul’s personhood is defined by romantic ideas of aristocracy that formed after the enlightenment. These ideas are visible in Paul’s almost fragile, pale, and skinny body as a stereotype that is reminiscent of the romantic depiction of young intellectual or artistic aristocrats in the romantic era (Martinez, 2013, pp. 2-3), compared to the representation of masculinity in men like Gurney, Duncan, and Leto. This physical representation and reference to aristocracy renders Paul sensitive and aware of his environment and the people in it, which is a stereotype expressed through his character. It is also related to the training his mother imposed on him and add a superiority to his person.

¹Eugenic (verb) from eugenics (noun), meaning “causing improvement of hereditary qualities of a stock so as to dysgenic” and “of, relating to, or improved by eugenics” (Collins Dictionary, n.d.)

Individual and Collective Memory in the Formation of Identity

There is “individual and collective memory” (Hölscher, 2011, p. 47) as well as memory that is related to sources which can be personal values, social affiliations, material possessions, (Clayton, 2012, p. 4), mnemata which are (sacred) signs and monuments (Scheer, 2011, p. 17), and buildings in the world like ruins (Olalquiaga, 2017, p. 30). Memory thus takes a central role in the formation of identity. It must be perceived as continuum, or it will be regarded as fragmented (Weissberg, 1999, p. 10) which can lead to a crisis.

In Dune, Paul’s transformation into adulthood, the onset of Paul’s leadership and his rising power in the narrative (Viberg, 2019, p. 2), are guided, not by memories of the past but by memories of visions of the future. His dreams are filled with visions of Arrakis and the crusade, showing the connection to the desert planet which is later established physically by his presence when he steps on the sand and inhales the melange in the air, which leaves him paralyzed and engulfed in the presence of the desert and the approaching worm. In this moment of contact he is pulled into his vision by a force outside his control. This scene is different to the scene in which he touches the water on his home planet Caladan, which evokes a certain knowledge of a lingering nostalgia, a farewell of the moist, cold, and familiar environment. Paul draws his visions of Arrakis closer to physical existence with each exposure to Dune’s nature which provides these experiences. Through his visions and repeated contact, his identity becomes intertwined with the future of Arrakis, the Fremen and the worms. These visions are disruptions, they are discontinuous fragmented images, which leave Paul overwhelmed, disturbed and in fear of a coming crusade in his name. It also leaves him connected to people he has not yet met and places he has not yet visited.

A Symbolised Identity of the West

‘Paradoxically the creation of the self considers that on one hand neglect, ignorance or the destruction of other identities is perpetuated and on the other hand traditions are actively borrowed and manipulated and the qualities of the other are incorporated’ (Gruen, 2011, p. 2). When it came to the war with Persia, the Greeks started to distinguish themselves from the perceived other entity. Thus, in the collective construction of identity, the other is set into contrast by the “creation of distorted mirrors that highlight the distinguishing features of one society by playing them off against the stereotypes or negative images ascribed to ostensibly dissimilar societies” (Gruen, 2011, p. 1).

The sacred bull

Western ideas are shown to be part of Paul’s history throughout his heritage and training. His identity as heir of the house is imposed by the circumstances, he is born into that accompany him into becoming a man. Throughout the movie this is shown at several points. The bull is depicted as a symbol of the house Atreides. On one hand it stands for a historical link in the narrative that is peculiar to the House Atreides, on the other hand it is a symbol that links to a collective European identity (Fornäs, 2012, pp. 50-52) since it is related to the Greek mythology about Europe (Hard, 2004, p. 226). The bull killed Paul’s grandfather and it accompanies Paul’s transformation from a boy to a duke while the decline of house Atreides with the downfall of duke Leto is another meaning the bull evokes. Both happen at the same time as an inevitable development. While the young rises, the old one falls. The bull first appears on Caladan, where Paul is seen in anger at the grandfather’s tomb on which it is depicted. The bull and the matador-fighter as figure are standing in Paul’s room right before the attack, which may hint at the role Paul comes to play against house Harkonnen. The decapitated bull’s head statue is hanging above the exposed, vulnerable dead father. It is linking the death of both family leaders and hinting at the symbolic decapitation of the bull which points to violence and the sacred (Girard, 2013), where the bull becomes the sacrificial victim (Robinson, 2012, p. 6), when the camera zooms onto the bull’s head after Leto died. Western ideas of superiority and benevolence that are represented through house Atreides are symbolically attacked in this moment in the film and presume a possible future revenge. Something that may relate to how the West treats terror attacks. From here on, a part of Paul’s identity as something that refers to the West only, is injured when Paul notices his role and responsibility, and expresses his anger about the breeding program of the Bene Gesserit by referring to himself as a freak and drawing a line between him and his mother. In this moment he is also rejecting his heritage as much as he rejects the visions of the crusade. In this sense, Paul slowly departs on a spiritual journey to strengthen his own identity that will merge with the culture of the Fremen, the desert, and the worms.

Identity as Myth and Narrative

In the literature on memory and identity, it can be noted that identity is also a continuation of myth. The individual or collective identities of the present are related to “specific characters and events of the mythical past” (Hölscher, 2011, p. 48). It is thus an individual (or collective) constructed narrative, as Clayton (2012) suggests, that constitutes

information about experiences for each individual (p. 212). The narrative of identity is “a way of defining, describing, and locating oneself” (p. 211). Clayton defines identity as something that on one hand is created from within, and with labels of oneself, or by others from outside oneself. Identity then becomes a construct that inherits both forces. When it is internally constructed it will reflect on society. When it is imposed by others it will influence the self-perception of the individual. Thus, stereotypes can become a “self-fulfilling prophesy”, meaning that people will develop behaviours that are consistent with that assumed behaviour. Especially gender and ethnicity which are deemed as socially important are prone to fall into these stereotypes since they are relevant to culture (p. 210).

The Myth of the Mahdias Constructed Narrative

In Dune, the Bene Gesserit establish the myth of a messiah by word of mouth who will liberate the Fremen. They set the path and construct a narrative in their interest by exploiting the beliefs of the Fremen, leaving them with a tale that positions the Fremen as a people in need, a people who can only be free(d) by the leadership of a messiah, a Lisan Al Gaib who will be inserted into their culture from outside. The established prophecy becomes self-fulfilling for Paul, who fits into the supposed identity and over the course of the film integrates it in interaction with the Fremen who themselves wish for this prophecy to be true. It shows an exploitation of faith, and it situates the Fremen, and whoever identifies with this position in a place that renders them as unable to pursue freedom through their own means.

Clothes as a Link to Individual and Collective Identity

In terms of personal possessions or objects, clothes are an example that point to the construction of identity, (Weissberg, 1999, p. 14) since clothes are bound to the physical remnants of a person in form of an imprint of shape and smell (Stallybrass, 1999, p. 29). Clothes also fulfil another function, they visibly link individual identity to collective identity: to wear specific clothes means to be part of that group, household, or guild (Stallybrass, 1999, p. 30) and to signal this belonging outward. Cultural spaces and goods like artwork can possess an aura something that is attached to the object and that has no physical reality but affects people in their perception of the object, creating emotions and myths as well as a proof of its originality (Benjamin, 2003). Clothes also express an extension of the human and like language consist of a “richness in texture” as well as “splendour” (McLuhan, 2013, p. 109). ‘Garments express a *Zeitgeist* and provide information of the style of its time’ (Barthes, 2004, p. 3) as “historical and sociological object” (p. 4).

Attires as Signifier of Religious Identity and as Link to the Planets Environment

The identity of the Fremen in the first part of the film is shown as that of a collective identity that is intertwined with the shared religion and the belief of the Mahdi that creates a point of connection between Paul, Jessica and the Fremen. When Paul and Jessica arrive, a crowd of people is waiting in front of the thopters² where women wear a hijab-like attire, which is reminiscent of stereotypical representation of Islamic women (Alloula, 1986, p. 13). Jessica wears a hijab with facial jewellery herself, adjusting as a Bene Gesserit to the customs of the Fremen. The Fremen are later shown to pray in front of the mansion with close-ups of their hands holding prayer beads and books, while Paul crosses the palm garden. These two scenes construct the Fremen as a highly religious people, deeply linking them with old ideas of the West when it comes to Islam and Muslims in particular. The costumes of Jessica as Bene Gesserit instead were inspired by paintings of Goya and Giotto (Brzeski, 2021) and thus carry Christian connotation with it.

During the film, the Fremen’s identity is revealed to be deeply connected to the desert planet. This can be seen in the most important attire in the film, the still-suit that was shown in Paul’s studies and then introduced again through Liet Kynes when Leto and Paul are about to enter the desert for the first time. It is a suit, developed by the Fremen for the survival in the desert that distils the evaporating bodily liquids into drinkable water. It thus links the Fremen to the harsh climate and environment in which the suit becomes a necessity.

Boundaries between Self and Other

As discussed before, the self is defined by constructing an otherness that can have many shapes which includes space, people, and their customs as well as gender. This is a process that draws a line like a boundary that it tries to maintain through separating itself on a spectrum and placing itself as weight on one side and the other on an imagined opposite side. As Homi K. Bhabha (1994) discussed, boundaries can take many shapes and forms and are defined by something that he calls “the beyond”. These borders create “beginnings and endings”, “difference and

²A flying machine similar to a helicopter

identity, past and present, inside and outside, inclusion and exclusion” (p. 2). They can be the outlines of territories of the global world (p. xxii), they can be boundaries of ethnic or religious nature (p. xxiv). ‘They indicate cultural difference as consensual and conflictual’. “[T]hey may confound our definitions of tradition and modernity; realign the customary boundaries between the private and the public, high and low; and challenge normative expectations of development and progress” (p. 3). These boundaries may challenge us as soon as they mingle with what they try to separate. They exist at points of intersections and may thus be crossed. These create “moments or processes that are produced in the articulation of cultural differences” (p. 2).

The space as visible boundary

In *Dune* visible space is used to emphasize this partly abstract boundaries of difference. When Paul arrives with his parents on Dune and walks past the Fremen, they are separated by space. This scene and the positioning of the Fremen as onlookers who look at Paul and his mother draw a perceivable line between these two cultures, although there is no visible obstacle that holds the crowd back. In the palm garden scene, a gate separates Paul and the praying Fremen as well as space, only one gardener who functions as representative of the Fremen indicates a first point of connection when he talks to Paul about the importance of water. When Stilgar enters the hall with Duke Leto, atable creates a space in-between as a clear boundary between the Atréides and the Fremen, a physical obstacle to the Fremen leader. Every time, Paul encounters a Fremen the space in-between gets reduced, and the interaction becomes more dynamic. Paul is almost touching the Fremen as can be observed in the scene in which the maid Mape was almost killed by the hunter-seeker. Once Paul dresses in the still suit the space between him and the Fremen dissolves when Kynes inspects him before their first ride on a thopter or when he merges with the Fremen group in the end of the film. Although these examples focus on the space or distance between the protagonists they hint to a cultural difference. The physical distance or boundary only disappears once Paul embarks on his journey in the desert and enters the Fremen tribe.

Environment and Identity

Environmental identity is a form of connection of the human with a natural non-human environment, “which affects the way we perceive and act towards the world” (Clayton, 2012, p. 4). In regard to Orientalism, the environmental identity is linked to representations of the middle east which “nearly inevitably include desolate scenes of empty and parched deserts, punctuated, perhaps, with a lonely string of camels, a verdant but isolated oasis, or a beach with large dunes of golden sand [...]” (Davis, 2011, p. 1). Davis describes this imagery as part of the constructed portrayal of the Middle East by the “rise of Anglo-European imperial power in the region” (p. 1) that holds the natives accountable for the “environmental degradation” (p. 1). Although Davis defines “environmental imagery” as a constellation of beliefs that groups of humans construct about a certain landscape, typically local or regional, it generally includes judgements about that environment as well as how it came to be in its current condition (p. 3). In case of the *Dune* adaptation, there is yet no cause revealed for the degradation of the environment unlike the books. The imperial houses are extracting spice as recourse and perpetuating the state of the landscape in favour of the worms and the spice. They have no interest in restoring the planet's ecology in favour of the indigenous people since it would crash their profits and diminish their collective and technological addiction towards this substance. Liet Kynes, a Fremen, is the imperial ecologist. She created a laboratory that is shown briefly in the film where she grows plants to understand how to make the planet more inhabitable. In the book, the Fremen are the ones who create oasis-like areas in their sietches. The connection to the environment is only briefly hinted to in the film, when Paul has a vision of him and Chani watching the Mua'Dib, the desert mouse as well as the desire of Paul to make the planet inhabitable again. His care and empathy with the people of Dune and the planet as whole shows throughout the film and his behaviour when it comes to the Fremen and the environment they live in indicate the connection despite the differences in culture.

The totem and the sacred

When it comes to animals, people may imitate an animal as a means to create a connection to it. They compare it to a human or “take the perspective of the animal”. This process is reminiscent of what Claude Lévi-Strauss refers to as totemism which might be pointed to as an ancient form of environmental identity construction where tribes “form a living community with the animal species” and “bear animal names” (Lévi-Strauss, 1962, p. 38). This ancient relation to self and other (animal) was integrated in the culture of the tribe whose people worshiped the animal, creating myths, rules, prohibitions, rituals, and habits surrounding the animal, which became sacred in everything the animal related to, ate, and resembled (Lévi-Strauss, 1962, p. 95).

The Fremen are a tribal community with sacred rituals, who worship Shai-Hulud who is also referred to as the Maker which can be seen in the scene in which Paul, Leto and Kynes escape a worm and in which Kyne's prayer to Shai-Hulud can be heard. The relation to totemic practices is especially strong in the book, where the Fremen kill a worm-trout in ritual and transform the water of the bile through the help of the Bene Gesserit into the "Water of Life" that then sparks a ritualistic orgy. In the film, the sacred relation to the worm is only observable via Kynes and a depiction on the wall of the Atreides mansion on Dune where a worm is carved into stone, possessing a kind of halo, which is reminiscent of Christian depictions of saints and other iconic images. As totemic animal, the worm and the myths around the worm are integrated into the Fremen identity and into the environment since the worm is the maker of the spice.

Conclusion:-

This paper described a juxtaposition of ideas of the West and the East that is especially discussed by the discourse of Orientalism through other scholars. The construction of Identity however in the adaptation is in constant flux. It oscillates between two poles and can emerge as opposing representations on one hand, just to mingle in the narrative and its representations on the other hand. Stereotypes about an assumed traditional and religious culture are contrasted to a culture that is rendered as secular and technologically superior. The stereotypes itself aren't consistent since the Fremen in the desert do not seem to relate to the religious Fremen in the colonies. And although the identity of the hero, who likely holds the subject position of the audience, is going through a transformation throughout the film, dominant Orientalist tropes persist despite a diverse cast. It is also troubling to see that the construction of the landscape and environment in the orientalist discourse assumes a familiar representation of an imagined future which is not challenged since the narrative is from a 1960s book. In terms of identity, it could be shown how the construction of Paul's identity throughout the film undergoes a journey that brings him closer to the Fremen and closer to the environment. It is however questionable whether these classical narratives that construct identities through binaries of self and other may continue to be successful next to emerging narratives that are more diversified, complex, and new and not part of studio productions. Dune may be viewed as part of an entertainment industry that is continuously scrutinized through other media outlets and viewers, particularly when it comes to its hegemony and persistent, traditional stereotypes.

Bibliography:-

1. Alloula, M. (1986). *The Colonial Harem*. (M. Godzich, & W. Godzich, Trans.) University of Minnesota Press.
2. Anderson, W. (Director). (2018). *Isle of Dogs* [Motion Picture].
3. Barthes, R. (2004). *The Language of Fashion*. London: Bloomsbury.
4. Benjamin, W. (2003). *The Work of Art in the Age of Its Technological Reproducibility*, 3rd Version. In H. Eiland, & M. W. Jennings (Eds.), *Walter Benjamin, Selected Writings* (S. Verlag, Trans., Vol. 4, pp. 251-283). Harvard University Press.
5. Bernstein, M., & Studlar, G. (Eds.). (1997). *Visions of the East - Orientalism in Film*. New Jersey, New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
6. Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The location of Culture*. New York: Routledge.
7. Blomkamp, N. (Director). (2009). *District 9* [Motion Picture].
8. Broderick, D. (2003). *New Wave and backwash: 1960-1980*. In E. James, & F. Mendlesohn (Eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Science Fiction* (pp. 48-63). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
9. Brzeski, P. (2021, November 03). 'Dune' Costume Designer Shares Symbolic Inspirations for Epic's Visionary Styles. Retrieved December 23, 2022, from hollywoodreporter.com: <https://www.hollywoodreporter.com/movies/movie-features/dune-costume-designer-jacqueline-west-interview-1235041394/>
10. Cameron, J. (Director). (2009). *Avatar* [Motion Picture].
11. Clark, A. (2008). *Supersizing the Mind; Embodiment, Action and Cognitive Extension*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
12. Clayton, S. D. (2012, September). *Environment and Identity*. (P. E. Nathan, Ed.) *The Oxford Handbook of Environmental and Conservation Psychology*, 209-229.
13. Collins Dictionary. (n.d.). Definition of 'eugenic'. Retrieved 2018 June, from Collinsdictionary.com: <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/eugenic>
14. Davis, D. K. (2011). *Imperialism, Orientalism, and the Environment in the Middle East. History, Policy, Power, and Practice*. In *Environmental Imaginaries of the Middle East and North Africa* (pp. 1-22). Ohio University Press.

15. Defoort, C. (2014, April 28). Mohism. Retrieved 05 16, 2022, from Oxford Bibliographies: <https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199920082/obo-9780199920082-0092.xml>
16. Dowd, M. (2001, April 22). Liberties; Cuomos vs. Sopranos. Retrieved May 26, 2022, from The New York Times: <https://www.nytimes.com/2001/04/22/opinion/liberties-cuomos-vs-sopranos.html>
17. Durrani, H. (2021, October 18). The Muslimness of Dune: A Close Reading of “Appendix II: The Religion of Dune”. Retrieved April 10, 2022, from Tor: <https://www.tor.com/2021/10/18/the-muslimness-of-dune-a-close-reading-of-appendix-ii-the-religion-of-dune/>
18. Foucault, M. (1981). The Order of Discourse. In R. Young (Ed.), *Uniting the Text: A Post-Structuralist Reader* (pp. 48-78). Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.
19. Fornäs, J. (2012). *Signifying Europe*. UK: intellect Bristol.
20. Girard, R. (2013). *Violence and the Sacred*. Bloomsbury Academic.
21. Gruen, E. S. (2011). Introduction. In E. S. Gruen (Ed.), *Cultural Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean* (pp. 1-9). Los Angeles: The Getty Research Institute.
22. Hölscher, T. (2011). Myths, Images, and the Typology of Identities in early Greek Art. In E. S. Gruen (Ed.), *Cultural Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean* (pp. 47-65). Los Angeles: the Getty Research Institute.
23. Hard, R. (2004). *The Routledge Handbook of Greek Mythology*. London: Routledge.
24. Hecht, M. L. (1993). 002—a research odyssey: Toward the development of a communication theory of identity. *Communication Monographs*, 60(1), 76-82.
25. Herbert, B. (2003). *Dreamer of Dune: The Biography of Frank Herbert*. New York: Tom Doherty Associates Book.
26. Higgins, D. M. (2013, July). *Psychic Decolonization in 1960s Science Fiction*. *Science Fiction Studies*, 40(2), 228-245.
27. Jacob, F. (2022). *The Orientalist Semiotics of Dune*. Marburg: Büchner-Verlag eG.
28. Jefferess, D. (2020). Benevolence, global citizenship, and post-racial politics. In D. Chapman, T. Ruiz-Chapman, & P. Eglin (Eds.), *The Global Citizenship Nexus*, *Critical Studis* (pp. 175-193). Routledge.
29. Kafka, J. (1975, May). *Why Science Fiction?* *The English Journal*, 64(5), 46-53.
30. Kennedy, K. (2016, May 17). *Epic World-Building: Names and Cultures in Dune*. *Names A Journal of Onomastics*, 64(2), 99-108.
31. Kennedy, K. (2021, November). *Spice and Ecology in Herbert’s Dune: Altering the Mind and the Planet*. *Science Fiction Studies*, 48(3), pp. 444-461.
32. Khalid, M. (2011). *Gender, orientalism and representations of the ‘Other’ in the War on Terror*. *Global Change, Peace & Security*, 23(1), 15-29.
33. Lawrence, T. (1991). *Seven Pillars of Wisdom: A Triumph*. Anchor.
34. Lean, D. (Director). (1962). *Lawrence of Arabia* [Motion Picture].
35. Lévi-Strauss, C. (1962). *Totemism*. London: Merlin Press.
36. Lippmann, W. (1998). *Public Opinion*. New Brunswick and London: Transaction Publishers.
37. Mamdani, M. (2002). *Good Muslim, Bad Muslim: A Political Perspective on Culture and Terrorism*. *American Anthropologist*, 104(3), 766-775.
38. Martinez, G. G. (2013). *Romanticizing Tuberculosis: Poetry, Prose, Opera, and Society of the Romantic Era*. Texas State University-San Marcos.
39. McLuhan, M. (2013). *Understanding Media: The Extentions of Man*. Berkley, California: Ginko Press.
40. Nietzsche, F. (1999, December). *Thus Spake Zarathustra*. Retrieved June 18, 2022, from Gutenberg: <https://www.gutenberg.org/files/1998/1998-h/1998-h.htm>
41. Olalquiaga, C. (2017). *El Helicoide, Modern Ruins and the Urban Imaginary*. In L. Munteán, L. Plate, & A. Smelik (Eds.), *Materializing Memory in Art and Popular Culture* (pp. 29-43). New York: Routledge.
42. *Oxford Learner's Dictionary*. (2022). Definition of Messiah noun from the Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary. (O. U. Press, Producer) Retrieved 05 17, 2022, from Oxford Learner's Dictionaries: <https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/messiah?q=messiah>
43. Roberts, A. (2006). *The Impact of New Wave Science Fiction 1960s–1970s*. In A. Roberts, *The History of Science Fiction* (pp. 230-263). London: palgravemacmillan.
44. Robinson, G. A. (2012). *Bullfighting and Bull Taming: Formations of Religion and Masculinity*. UMI Dissertation Publishing.
45. Said, E. (2003). *Orientalism*. London: Penguin Groups.
46. Scheer, T. S. (2011). *Ways of Becoming Arcadian, Arcadian Foundation Myths in the Mediterranean*. In E. S. Gruen (Ed.), *Cultural Identity in the Ancient Mediterranean* (pp. 11-25). Los Angeles: The Getty Research Institute.

47. Shaheen, J. G. (2003, July). Reel Bad Arabs: How Hollywood Vilifies a People. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 588, 171-193.
48. Singh, S. (2012, November). Messiahs and Martyrs: Religion in selected novels of Frank Herbert's *Dune Chronicles*. 0-145. (P. D. Levey, Ed.) University of South Africa.
49. Stallybrass, P. (1999). Worn Worlds: Clothes, Mourning and the Life of Things. In D. Ben-Amos, & L. Weissberg (Eds.), *Cultural Memory and the Construction of Identity* (pp. 27-44). Detroit: Wayne State University Press.
50. Tarantino, Q. (Director). (2012). *Django Unchained* [Motion Picture].
51. Viberg, P. K. (2019, Spring). Age of Arrakis: State Apparatuses and Foucauldian Biopolitics in Frank Herbert's *Dune*. Stockholm University, Department of English.
52. Villeneuve, D. (Director). (2021). *Dune* [Motion Picture].
53. Wachowski, L., Tykwer, T., & Wachowski, L. (Directors). (2012). *Cloud Atlas* [Motion Picture].
54. Weissberg, L. (1999). Learning Culture. In D. Ben-Amos, & L. Weissberg (Eds.), *Cultural Memory and the Construction of Identity* (pp. 7-26). Wayne State University Press.
55. Wolf, M. J. (2012). *Building Imaginary Worlds: The Theory and History of Subcreation*. New York: Routledge.
56. Zieger, S. (2007, October). Pioneers of Inner Space: Drug Autobiography and Manifest Destiny. *PMLA*, 122, 1531-1547.
57. Zwick, E. (Director). (2003). *The Last Samurai* [Motion Picture].